DEVELOPING TEACHERS: A REVIEW OF EARLY PROFESSIONAL LEARNING
SYSTEMATIC LITERATURE REVIEW
COMMISSIONED BY
THE GENERAL TEACHING COUNCIL SCOTLAND

DEVELOPING TEACHERS:
A REVIEW OF EARLY PROFESSIONAL LEARNING

FULL REPORT

Valerie Wilson, John Hall, Julia Davidson and Jon Lewin
JANUARY 2006

SCRE CENTRE
UNIVERSITY
of
GLASGOW

FACULTY OF EDUCATION
## Contents

Review Teams 3

Executive Summary 4

1 Introduction 8
  1.1 Background to the review 8
  1.2 Aims 8
  1.3 Definition and scope 8
  1.4 Search methods 9
  1.5 Organisation of the review 11

2 CPD models and provision 12
  2.1 Introduction 12
  2.2 Models of professional development 12
  2.3 Provision of CPD in the UK 17
  2.4 Provision of CPD overseas 18
  2.5 Summary 21

3 Early professional learning 23
  3.1 Introduction 23
  3.2 Stages of a teacher's career 23
  3.3 Factors influencing teachers' careers 26
  3.4 Meeting beginner teachers' developmental needs 28
  3.5 Summary 31

4 Scottish evidence 33
  4.1 Introduction 33
  4.2 The Scottish context 33
  4.3 Early professional learning opportunities 34
  4.4 Who participates in CPD? 35
  4.5 Teachers' views of early years of professional development? 36
  4.6 On-going research in this area 37
  4.7 Summary 37

5 Developments in other professions 39
  5.1 Introduction 39
  5.2 Training other professionals 39
  5.3 Comparison with teaching 41
  5.4 Voluntary or compulsory CPD? 42
  5.5 Summary 44

6 Findings and conclusions 45
  6.1 Introduction 45
  6.2 Findings 45
  6.3 Conclusions 48
  6.4 Implications 49

References 50

Appendix 1: Search strategy 55
Review Teams

Research Team, SCRE Centre, Glasgow University Faculty of Education
Valerie Wilson
John Hall
Julia Davidson
Jon Lewin

Review Team, Department of Curriculum Studies, Glasgow University Faculty of Education
Brian Templeton
Moya Cove
Margo Barr
Harry Blee
Executive Summary

Introduction

Continuing professional development (CPD) is now a compulsory and accepted part of the contracts of all teachers who teach in Scottish schools, but what constitutes appropriate development for all the various stages of a teacher's career is less well defined. This review, commissioned by the General Teaching Council Scotland (GTC Scotland), presents the results from a systematic review of literature on early professional learning, ie post probation and up to five years of professional practice. It was undertaken by the Scottish Centre for Research in Education (SCRE), Glasgow University, with support from the Department of Curriculum Studies, Glasgow University Faculty of Education, between January and July 2004. It draws on articles published during the past 10 years in Scotland, the rest of the UK and selected overseas countries. Approximately 3500 articles about teachers' CPD were identified but only 13 related to early professional development.

Key findings

Developmental stages

Researchers (Bolam, 2000; Harland and Kinder, 1997; Lee, 1997) suggest that teachers pass through a number of developmental stages as they progress from beginner to expert practitioner. Specifically:

- Some researchers associate different concerns with different stages of a teacher's development. The most widely cited model was developed by Fuller (Fuller, 1969; Fuller and Brown, 1975), who identified the stages as: concern for *self* (primary survival as a teacher); concern for the *task* (which focuses on actual performance); and concern for *impact* (relating to positive influence upon pupils).
- More recent research, while accepting Fuller's model, offers slight amendments. Pigge and Marso (1997) suggest that beginner teachers are concerned about impact throughout their development; and Clark and Conway (2003) argue that beginner teachers simultaneously pursue a 'journey outward' and an 'inward journey' as their concerns deepen through reflexivity and attention to self-development.
- Allen and Casbergue (1997) report that beginner teachers are able to recall events in the classroom reasonably accurately and thus begin to reflect on their own performance; in contrast more experienced teachers take a more holistic approach to their recall, performance and achievement of objectives.

Influences on teachers' careers

A number of studies identify factors that influence beginner teachers' career decisions:

- Johnson and Birkeland (2003) report that new teachers who felt successful were more likely to remain in the profession.
- Gay and Ryan (1996) found that new teachers remained in their post because they liked the job but were dissatisfied with the number of changes and the workload.
- Flores (2001) notes the strong impact of the workplace on new teachers' development.
Models and organisation of continuing professional development

Researchers (eg Castle et al., 1998; Clark and Hollingsworth, 2002; Draper et al., 1991; Harland and Kinder, 1997; Ling and Mackenzie, 2001; Thomas et al., 1998) offer a number of explanatory models of CPD. These include partnerships, apprenticeships, technocratic, competence-based, input/output, linear, collegiate/community of learners and interactive/interconnected approaches. In sum:

- Some researchers (Bolam, 2000; McMahon, 1999) suggest that the emphasis for CPD in the UK has shifted from a focus on teachers’ individual needs to meeting systemic needs, which reflect Government policy to raise standards and ensure managerial accountability.
- A number of studies (Bolam, 2000; Hustler et al., 2003) indicate that teachers define CPD conservatively and associate it primarily with attendance at courses, seminars or workshops.
- There has been a tendency across most European countries (Eurydice, 2003) to devolve responsibility for the budgets for teachers’ CPD to school or local levels.
- CPD for teachers in the UK is offered by a variety of public and private sector providers (Bolam, 2000; Hustler et al., 2003). These include Higher Education Institutions (HEIs), education authorities, schools and private consultancies.
- In Northern Ireland (Kearns, 2001) different organisations act as lead partners for different stages of teacher education: HEIs are responsible for initial teacher education; Education and Library Boards lead on induction; and schools on CPD.
- Increasingly, researchers (eg Ling and Mackenzie, 2001) perceive CPD to be most effectively organised as a partnership between HEIs, employers and teachers.

Early professional development

Few references referred specifically to early professional learning. The available evidence indicates the following:

- Brighouse (1995) identifies five stages in a teacher’s development: the second stage is from beginner teacher to established expert.
- Some researchers (Hustler et al., 2003; Lewis et al., 1999) report differences in teachers’ choice of CPD activity according to their length of time in the profession.
- Hustler et al. (2003) found that in England, older teachers across all stages felt that the CPD could not relate to their individual professional needs. In contrast, many younger teachers and newly qualified staff believed that CPD could meet systemic needs and also wanted their individual development needs to be met.
- Lewis et al. (1999) report that inexperienced teachers in the USA were more likely to select CPD related to classroom management (65 per cent of those with 3 or fewer years compared with 43 per cent of those with 20 years experience). New teachers were also more likely to participate in in-depth studies relating to their main teaching assignment and programmes addressing the needs of students with limited proficiency in English or from diverse cultural backgrounds.
- Kearns (2001) reports that primary teachers at the end of their third year of teaching in Northern Ireland report undertaking CPD in writing, pupil behaviour, reading and aspects of the religious curriculum. Evidence was included in their Professional Development Activities’ portfolios, which all teachers in Northern Ireland must now maintain.
- Killeavy (2001) found that new teachers in Ireland who had performed less well in the Irish School Leaving Certificate and in their BEd degree were more likely to participate in in-service than their more academically able colleagues.
• Pigge and Marso (1997) report that those new teachers in the USA who had been good students expressed less concern about self-survival in teaching and may be lulled into very low levels of self-concern by their previous academic success.

Voluntary or compulsory CPD?
A number of researchers have compared initial training and CPD for teachers with that offered to members of other professions. It emerges that:

• CPD is now either compulsory or an implicit part of the code of practice of accountancy, medicine, nursing, professions allied to medicine and social work in the UK (DKZ Pieda, 2002). However, some researchers fear that by making CPD compulsory, members of various professions may seek to comply with the requirements in the quickest, easiest way (Wilson and Bagley, 1999).
• CPD is also compulsory for teachers in approximately half of the countries in the European Union and most of the states in the USA (Eurydice, 2003).

Scottish evidence
No evidence relating specifically to early professional learning among teachers in Scottish schools was identified. However:

• A study that is part of the Economic and Social Science Research Council's (ESRC) Teaching and Learning Research Programme (McNally et al., on-going) should reveal results in this area by 2008 (tlrp.esrc@org.uk).
• No education authority in Scotland reported that they had developed policies or provision for teachers in the early years of their professional development; one indicated (personal correspondence, 20 February 2004) that it was currently consulting on a policy which would cover the first five years of professional practice.

Conclusions

Stages of development
Many researchers accept that members of the teaching profession develop through a series of career stages, each of which is associated with specific needs and concerns. The needs of the new teacher represent a transition from a focus on self and survival to task and impact. However, the specific needs associated with each have not been well defined by research.

Influences on career
A number of studies show that new teachers’ careers can be influenced by their experiences in the early years of professional practice. A supportive school and/or department appear to be the strongest positive influence on career development; however, a heavy workload and perceptions of constant change are career inhibitors.

Models of professional development
No one model of CPD was shown to be the most effective. However, researchers favour partnerships between individual teachers, schools and HEIs based upon negotiated needs. In addition, researchers point out that many teachers define CPD conservatively to mean courses, seminars and workshops.
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Early professional development

What little evidence emerged seems to suggest that the needs of new teachers differ from those of their more experienced colleagues. New teachers want their individual development needs to be met and are more likely to undertake CPD related to classroom management or specific aspects of the curriculum. Researchers argue that CPD should be based upon diverse interrelated personal and professional needs. None has gone so far as to suggest that the teaching profession should emulate medicine in which continuing professional development for new teachers is predominantly workplace-based from practising members of the same profession. There is, however, some evidence to indicate that particular attention needs to be paid to CPD for academically able recruits to the teaching profession, who may be less aware that they need continuing development than their less able colleagues are.

Other professions

The teaching profession in Scotland has accepted that CPD should be compulsory throughout a teacher’s career. However, the contrast with the early professional development of doctors in the UK is stark. Until appointed consultants, doctors accept that most of their formal early professional learning will take place in the workplace (ie in hospitals and clinics) and be organised and delivered by other more senior members of their own profession. They also expect to learn informally from experienced colleagues and nursing staff as they jointly deliver a health service to patients. Some researchers argue that schools would have to be modified if they are to support school-based CPD, which is responsive to teachers’ needs.

Scottish evidence

There is no relevant published Scottish research about teachers’ early professional learning: evidence in this area will only emerge in 2008 when on-going research for the ESRC’s Teaching and Learning Programme is completed.

Implications

The key message to come from this review is simple: a great deal of effort is being put into developing frameworks for CPD for various stages of a teacher’s career. The Scottish Executive, education authorities in Scotland, teachers’ professional associations, higher education institutions (HEIs) and the GTC Scotland, all seem to be aware of the need to offer support to probationer teachers and also career development opportunities for those who wish to pursue Chartered Teacher status or the Scottish Qualification for Headship in order to further their careers. Some of these initiatives have been the subject of published evaluations (Malcolm and Wilson, 2000; Murphy et al., 2002). So far, little attention appears to have been paid to:

- identifying the CPD needs specifically associated with the transition from newly qualified to experienced teacher
- developing provision to meet these needs
- identifying provision and support which new teachers have found helpful; and
- evaluating the impact of such CPD on newly qualified teachers’ personal and professional development, their career satisfaction and retention and changes in their classroom practices and the subsequent effect on pupils.

Apart from the on-going ESRC study by McNally et al., teachers’ early professional learning has been a neglected area.
1 Introduction

1.1 Background to the review

The teaching profession in Scotland is changing. These changes were heralded by *A Teaching Profession for the 21st Century* (McCrone Agreement) (Scottish Executive Education Department, 2001), an integral part of which was a commitment to develop and support teachers. Continuing Professional Development (CPD) was made a condition of service and every teacher is now expected to have a commitment to CPD, to agree individual CPD plans once a year with his or her immediate manager and to maintain a personal record of CPD undertaken. CPD was portrayed as an essential opportunity for staff, which should be available to every teacher. Education authorities, as employers, were tasked with ensuring that a wide range of CPD development opportunities was available and teachers are expected to undertake a programme of agreed CPD. All of this could be viewed as a positive step forward for the teaching profession in Scotland. However, what constitutes appropriate CPD to meet the needs of teachers at different stages of their careers remains an issue. In particular, little appears to have been written about the particular needs of new teachers who have completed their probationary period. This literature review, commissioned by the General Teaching Council Scotland (GTC Scotland) and undertaken by the Scottish Council for Research in Education (SCRE) Centre, between January and July 2004, addresses this issue.

1.2 Aims

The overarching aim is to review systematically, the literature published during the past 10 years relating to Professional Development in the Early Years of Teaching in Scotland, the rest of the UK and abroad, in order to inform policy development, share effective practices and underpin future research. The review covers:

- both the content and the process of CPD in these early years; and
- the balance between different types of CPD.

1.3 Definition and scope

The ‘early years of teaching’ is defined as the first 5 years of a teacher’s career from achievement of full registration. The definition of ‘professional development’ will be kept wide, to reflect the agreement reached after the McCrone report:

‘An additional contractual 35 hours of CPD per annum will be introduced as a maximum for all teachers, which shall consist of an appropriate balance of personal professional development, attendance at nationally accredited courses, small scale school based activities or other CPD activity. This balance will be based on an assessment of individual need taking account of school, local and national priorities and shall be carried out at an appropriate time and place’.

*(A Teaching Profession for the 21st Century, Section 2.5)*

Specifically included within ‘professional development’ will be such activities as:

- involvement with teacher research or teacher-researcher groups
involvement in working parties within schools; and
activities associated with professional and/or subject associations.

As well as accredited courses, in-service events, etc, the Scottish Executive has written that ‘a CPD activity is anything that has progressed a teacher’s existing skills or enhanced her or his professionalism’ (Professional Review and Development, 2003). The focus of the review will be on the intersection between ‘professional development’ and the ‘early years of teaching’. It will therefore exclude initial training, probationer development and training for senior management (eg Scottish Qualification for Headship, SQH), although clearly these impact on the continuity of a teacher’s professional development.

The scope of the review is:

- Literature published in the last 10 years
- Published articles, official publications and ‘grey’ literature
- Literature from Scotland and the rest of the UK
- Such literature from the USA, Commonwealth and European countries as is deemed appropriate and relevant.

Six questions have been applied to the literature:

1. What are the CPD needs of teachers in the early years of their professional development?
2. How are these met in different educational systems?
3. Which approaches to CPD do newly qualified teachers prefer?
4. What appears to be the impact of CPD on new teachers and their pupils?
5. What CPD opportunities are offered to newly qualified members of other professions?
6. What does the Scottish evidence tell us?

1.4 Search methods

In previous SCRE reviews (eg Harlen and Malcolm, 1997), we have utilised the concept of ‘best evidence synthesis’, which Slavin (1987, 1990) applied to reviewing educational research. It requires the reviewer to identify criteria for determining good quality research and to place more emphasis on those studies, which match the criteria than those which have identifiable shortcomings.

Other researchers have developed different approaches to identifying high quality evidence. For example, the Campbell Collaboration (Boruch et al., 1999) sets a premium on evidence generated from randomised field trials. As will become apparent in the review, few studies published on CPD can meet these strict criteria. We have therefore, included a number of small-scale studies and reports from official sources, which, although not meeting the quality criteria, do offer some insight into this under-researched topic.

It is against this background that this current review should be placed and its limitations made explicit: first, that approximately 3500 items were identified using a combination of ‘CPD’ and ‘teachers’ or combinations of similar key words (see Appendix), but very few for ‘beginner’ or ‘novice teacher’. Second, that although criteria were established, adherence to strict criteria for best evidence was frequently not possible. For example, there is a paucity of well-planned studies and the application of strict criteria would have left the review with little to report. Finally, some studies provide insufficient information upon which to judge the quality of evidence.

The criteria for inclusion of studies in this review are:
Developing Teachers: a review of early professional learning

- Papers published during the past 10 years
- Studies relating to CPD for teachers in primary (elementary) and secondary mainstream schooling
- Studies of well-designed experimental interventions in CPD.

Specifically, the objectives of the review were to:

- Establish two review groups, one of experienced researchers drawn from the SCRE Centre staff and a second composed of developing reviewers drawn from the University of Glasgow Faculty of Education.
- Identify inclusion and exclusion categories to ensure that only high quality, robust studies were included in the review process and to agree these with the GTC Scotland.
- Engage providers of Initial Teacher Education (ITE) in the review process, so that their review skills are developed, as well as their substantive knowledge of CPD in the early years.
- Agree a set of key words with the two review groups within a workshop.
- Search five electronic databases, ie Educational Research in Scotland (ERSDAT) for Scottish research, the British Education Index (BEI) and Current Educational Research in the UK (CERUK) for British sources, Educational Resources Information Centre (ERIC) and the Social Science Citation Index (SSCI) for international references, plus hand searching iteratively in the Edinburgh University Library and via the Internet.
- Annotate references and enter on an electronic database.
- Analyse and extract data from key papers/reports/articles (an overview of the model for analysing the literature is shown in Figure 1.1).
- Synthesise data from all sources judged to meet the final inclusion criteria.
- Draw out the implications for Scottish Education, the GTCS and stakeholders.
- Disseminate the findings in order to encourage research-based practice in CPD.
Figure 1.1 Outline model for classifying the literature

Figure 1.1 is a schematic representation of the classification system used to organise the literature included in the review. The categories are not mutually exclusive (i.e., a reference may be included under more than one heading).

1.5 Organisation of the review

The findings from this review have been organised by research question. The report is presented in six sections, of which this Introduction is the first. In Section 2 the various models and provision of CPD identified by researchers are explored. Section 3 presents the main evidence on the development of early professional learning. Section 4 goes on to identify available Scottish evidence and approaches to developing other professionals are presented in Section 5. The final section, Section 6, offers some findings and conclusions that follow from the review and suggests areas where further research may be necessary.
2 CPD models and provision

2.1 Introduction

It is now recognised that initial education can no longer provide teachers with all the knowledge and skills that they will require throughout their professional lives. A survey of the profile, trends and concerns of the teaching profession in Europe (Eurydice, 2004) points out that in the context of lifelong learning, several countries in Europe increasingly refer to teacher development as 'continuing professional development' (CPD) rather than 'in-service training'. The implication is that the term encompasses a larger range of possibilities for professional development, which support continuity and coherence between different stages of a teacher's professional career. This section begins with a brief summary of the various models of CPD found in the published literature. Evidence of the ways in which teachers are developed is also presented. Most of the references are from studies undertaken in England, but by way of comparison, some international examples are included. It should be noted that Scottish evidence is discussed in a separate section (Section 4). The studies in this section provide a snapshot of the ways in which other national education systems develop their teachers. The most significant point to emerge is that few refer directly to the needs of teachers in the early years of their professional development.

2.2 Models of professional development

Changing models

Numerous researchers and academics have offered definitions and explanatory models of continuing professional development. For example in an early paper, Eraut (1977) defines teacher development as:

'The natural process of professional growth in which a teacher gradually acquires confidence, gains new perspectives, increases in knowledge, discovers new methods and takes on new roles'.

(Quoted by Lee, 1997, p. 18)

Eraut believes that teacher development is influenced by three factors:

1 The knowledge, experience and personality of the teacher
2 The school context
3 Professional contact and discussion outside the school.

Building on Eraut's work, Lee (1997) suggests three necessary conditions for teacher development:

'The individual – their personal continuing professional development.  
The institution – reflective interaction within the teaching-learning situation.  
The managerial – planned staff development activities'.

Bolam (2000) offers a more developed concept of continuing professional development as:

'... those education, training and job-embedded support activities engaged in by teachers, following their initial certification and headteachers. Such activities are aimed primarily at
adding to their professional knowledge, improving their professional skills and helping them to clarify their professional values so that they can educate their students more effectively'.

(Bolam, 2000, p. 267)

He points to two major policy initiatives – the ‘raising of standards’ and the ‘managerialist’ approach – which he believes have dominated education in the UK since the late 1970s. Prior to the advent of these two policies, CPD gave primacy to the needs of individual professionals and even the movement towards school-focused in-service and curriculum development were largely controlled by teachers. Although he refers specifically to development in England and Wales, the same policy imperatives have influenced Scotland. For example, in the mid-1980s, funding for CPD was associated with the Technical and Vocational Education Initiative (TVEI) – a national UK initiative. He summarises the major changes in CPD as:

‘Five INSET days (in England). 
A regulated market for in-service training in which schools receive annual funding to buy training and consultancy. 
A substantial reduction in the capacity of LEAs to deliver training. 
A substantial increase in the number of professional associations and unions, private trainers and consultants. 
Growth in the number of other agencies specialising in the provision of school leadership training. 
Growing involvement of industry in leadership training. 
More flexible and market-driven university/higher education structures up to Masters level (eg modularisation, credit transfer and accumulation, accreditation of prior learning, open learning). 
Substantial increase in taught doctorates’.

(Adapted from Bolam, 2000: 269)

To support his views, Bolam quotes from McMahon’s (1999) study of CPD undertaken by teachers in 66 schools in four English local authorities. She found that the CPD market was substantially influenced by the school’s location, the size of the CPD budget and the status of the school. The aims and content of all training activities were primarily determined by the national reform agenda, delivered in short training courses, despite the fact that previous research has shown this to be weak at promoting change. All of this evidence, Bolam suggests, demonstrate that national needs have come to dominate the CPD agenda and what is required now is a shift in paradigm, a refocusing on ‘strengthening opportunities for individual teachers to meet their professional needs … because ultimately, this will be to the benefit of students and schools …’ (p. 278).

Input/output model

Harland and Kinder (1997) draw on their longitudinal study of staff development concerned with science education in primary schools in Calderdale Local Education Authority to develop an input/output model of CPD. They collected evidence from interviews and classroom observation in five case-study schools over a 3-year period, from which nine in-service education and training (INSET) outcomes emerged:

1 Material and provisionary outcomes, ie worksheets, equipment. 
2 Informational outcomes, ie being briefed. 
3 New awareness, ie a perceptual or conceptual shift.
4 Value congruence outcomes, ie personalised versions of curriculum or classroom management.
5 Affective outcomes, ie emotional experience from the learning situation.
6 Motivational and attitudinal outcomes, ie enhanced enthusiasm.
7 Knowledge and skills, ie the development of deeper levels of understanding, critical reflexivity and theoretical rationales.
8 Institutional outcomes, ie collective impact of teachers and their practice on schools.
9 Impact on practice, ie changes in teachers’ practices within the classroom.

These nine are organised into three orders of importance (Table 2.1).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 2.1 An ordering of INSET outcomes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3rd order Provisionary Information New awareness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2nd order Motivation Affective Institutional</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1st order Value congruence Knowledge and skills Impact on practice</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Harland and Kinder, 1997, p. 77).

From teachers’ accounts of the impact of CPD juxtaposed with their classroom observations, the researchers suggest that CPD experiences, which focused only on third order outcomes, are least likely to impact on teaching practice. They conclude that in order to maximise the impact of CPD on classroom practice, all nine outcomes need to be present. However, the presence of the two first order outcomes, ie value congruence and knowledge and skills, consistently coincided with a substantial impact on teaching practices.

**Partnerships**

A study of CPD across the countries in the European Union (Eurydice, 2004) utilises a model of teacher education based upon a continuum from initial teacher education, through induction to in-service education. The report suggests that although policies to encourage this development already exist in several European countries and are being planned or under discussion in others, various factors may affect the continuity of professional development which teachers’ experience. In most European countries, the same providers offer both initial and in-service opportunities, often on the same premises. However, as the report states, ‘geographical integration or proximity does not necessarily ensure conceptual continuity’ (p. 21). Despite this potential problem, the authors believe that, as a consequence of decentralisation in most European countries, initial and in-service education are becoming closer to schools, with a growing number actually delivering training on school premises and forming active partnerships between HEIs and schools. These partnerships are aimed at helping providers meet teachers’ needs more effectively, but without national co-ordination, consistency may vary and continuity of provision throughout the various stages of a teacher’s career may be lacking.

**Community of learners**

A number of authors seek to locate CPD within a community of learners. For example, Clement and Vandenberghe (2000) highlight the tensions that may exist between the solitary and the collegial models of teachers’ professional development. From a study of 94 teachers in Belgium, they conclude that:

‘Teachers should be motivated to collaborate, if this collaboration gives rise to the creation of learning opportunities and an adequately adjusted learning space. But longing for a
completely collegial school is as unrealistic as undesirable. Most teachers plan and teach certain things better when working completely autonomously'.

(Clement and Vandenberghe, 2000, p. 98)

The challenge, as Hargreaves (1994, p. 67) points out, is how to 'create schools where teachers' professional development is fostered through an inspiring interplay between profound variants of autonomy and collegiality'. Clement and Vandenberghe believe that this can happen if workplace conditions are 'modified in a way that makes clear that collaboration implies challenges for professional development without teachers having to abandon their autonomy' (p. 98).

Further evidence about how a 'community of learners' operates is provided by Thomas et al. (1998). They report an action research project in which teachers from English and history departments at a large high school in Seattle met twice a month for two and a half years in order to develop their practice. Project activities included reading and discussing pieces of fiction and history, developing an interdisciplinary humanities curriculum and videotaping and viewing classroom practices. Initial findings identify enhanced collegiality among teachers within the two departments; reduced feelings of teacher isolation; and the development of an intellectual community for teachers within the high school. Interestingly, the researchers report that teachers at different points in their careers were affected differently by their experience of participating in the action learning projects. A number of experienced teachers appreciated the opportunity to engage in substantive intellectual discussions with peers, but they also appreciated the 'personal and endemic limits of reform initiatives' (p. 26). In contrast, overcoming isolation was a common theme for new teachers who had not been socialised into the conditions of the school and the teaching profession. The researchers report that participation in the project had provided newer teacher (1–2 years' experience) with the opportunity to develop a sense of camaraderie with their peers and more experienced colleagues and also an opportunity to widen their vision from their initial focus on classroom management and day-to-day planning. This latter example illustrates the action research/action learning approach pioneered by Stenhouse (Schools Council Humanities Project, 1975) and practised for many years by other researchers, such as Elliot, at the University of East Anglia.

An industrial model

Draper et al. (1991) cite an industrial model from Nicholson (1984) to help them understand the experiences of a cohort of probationer teachers, who first entered teaching in Scotland in 1988. In total, 200 probationers and 240 headteachers returned completed questionnaires (response rates, 60 per cent and 80 per cent, respectively). The model was based upon four stages:

1 Preparation including recruitment and selection into a job.
2 Encounter when the job begins.
3 Adjustment when the new entrant settles into his/her post.
4 Stabilisation in which future career developments are considered.

By the end of the 3-year project, the researchers report that stabilisation had begun to occur for many probationers: the job had been shaped and newly qualified teachers felt settled. Nearly all probationer teachers in their sample had begun to consider their career prospects by the end of probation. Approximately 93 per cent of primary and 96 per cent of secondary teachers had assessed their prospects (and a third of primary and a half of secondary teachers thought these were good). Some 28 per cent of primary and 30 per cent of secondary teachers had developed strategies to take their careers forward. Some reported that they had been helped by comments from colleagues and promoted staff, who had encouraged them to build-up experience in those subjects in which they thought had better career prospects. However, given the changing nature
of teaching and of the educational system, the researchers thought that it might be difficult for new teachers to identify or achieve stabilisation in post.

Technocratic models

Castle et al. (1998) describe three models of professional education based on variations of a technocratic approach. The first they refer to as the technocratic or apprenticeship model, which is characterised by on-the-job training and a very limited input from educational institutions. This is criticised because it presents the achievement of professional standards as unproblematic. The second, a technocratic model, they suggest, has become the predominant form of professional education for a wide range of occupational groups. It utilises a curriculum based upon three elements: a systematic knowledge base, the application of the knowledge base to professional practice and supervised practice in the workplace. Courses are generally provided by educational institutions which control the curriculum content and assessment. Critics suggest that this model has resulted in the separation of theory from practice. The third model, an emergent form, is based upon a post-technocratic approach. The researchers suggest that this is developing to overcome the perceived weaknesses in the technocratic model. This model is ‘characterised by an emphasis on professional competencies through the experience of practice and the systematic reflection on practice in a practicum’ (p. 329). Central to the post-technocratic model is the concept of partnership between higher education institutions, employers and learners. No evidence is provided to show the comparative efficacy of each, or how CPD for newly qualified teachers might be addressed under each model. The researchers conclude that professionals should be involved in their own development and quote Eraut (1994) who warned against reliance on any system which can alienate professionals and weaken their commitment to personal moral accountability for their practice.

Interactive/interconnected models

A number of studies of Australian teachers’ professional growth suggest that an interactive or interconnected model of CPD is the most effective in bringing about changes in teaching practices. For example, Ling and Mackenzie (2001) discuss two models of professional development, both of which incorporate the same three elements, ie professional development programmes, the school and the teacher. The difference lies in the type and level of interaction between the three elements. In Model 1, referred to as the ‘Lawnmower Approach’, the three elements ‘float independently of one another, with the professional development program providers apparently sending one-way, program-specific signals to professional development participants (teachers)’ (p. 94). Participants are able, because of their previous experiences, to interpret the messages coming from the programmes and apply them in their respective schools. Their schools may provide little or no input into the programmes and little support for teachers when they return to school after CPD events. The researchers believe that with the exception of highly motivated teachers, Model 1 will result in little change at school level. They argue that a dynamic interaction is required between the three elements for change to occur. In Model 2, the ‘Turbine Approach’, the same elements are present, however, they are ‘linked by a negotiated need or objective with interaction, which is dynamic’ (p. 95). Goals are shared among the stakeholders, ie providers, schools and teachers; critical reflection of performance of all parties is central and professional development providers are sufficiently flexible and knowledgeable to respond to these diverse and changing needs. The researchers suggest that when the model is working well, change is not limited to the learner, but can occur in both providers and schools, provided there is an organisational culture that supports reflective action.

Some researchers think that CPD has been erroneously portrayed as a linear process (eg Clark and Hollingsworth, 2002). The same point is reiterated by Poulson and Avramidis (2003), who suggest that the non-linear nature of many teachers’ career development, especially primary school teachers who can move between different subjects and year groups, poses particular
problems for CPD. Fullan (1982) found that many professional development programmes attempt to change teachers' beliefs and attitudes, anticipating that this will lead to changes in classroom practice. Others focus directly on changing teachers' classroom practices, in the hope that attitudinal changes will follow behavioural changes. An alternative model emerged from three Australian studies, related to the development of mathematics teachers in Victoria. Clark and Hollingsworth (2002) suggest that CPD encompasses four domains:

1. External stimuli (external domain)
2. Knowledge, beliefs or attitudes (personal domain)
3. Professional experimentation (domain of practice)
4. Salient outcomes (domain of consequences).

The researchers observed that teachers could develop multiple growth networks by enactment and reflection across different combinations of the four domains. They recommend a responsive approach be taken to the provision of CPD, in which programmes should be deliberately designed to offer participants the opportunity to enact change in a variety of forms and change sequences consistent with their individual inclinations. This, they argue, would take account of the situated and personal nature of teaching and teacher growth.

2.3 Provision of CPD in the UK

The most recently published large-scale study of teachers' CPD in England was undertaken in 2003 for the DfES (Hustler et al., 2003). The researchers surveyed over 2500 teachers in primary, secondary and special schools in England, in order to establish teachers' previous experiences of CPD, their current attitudes towards it and their future expectations. The main findings to emerge are:

Most teachers were satisfied with their CPD over the last 5 years. Key features of worthwhile CPD were perceived to be relevance and applicability to school/classroom settings. Negative feelings were associated with 'one size fits all' standardised CPD provision.

Most CPD focused on teaching skills and subject knowledge and was led predominantly by school staff. Few teachers took part in CPD activities such as research, secondments and award bearing courses or international visits.

Although perceptions of CPD varied according to school and career stage, most teachers operated with a traditional model of CPD as courses, conferences or in-service days.

Teachers identified financial costs, distance and workload as inhibitors of access to CPD.

Most teachers felt that the principal drivers of CPD over the past 5 years had been school development needs and national priorities and these had taken precedence over individual needs.

Most teachers accepted that there should be a balance between system (school and national needs) CPD and individual needs.

Attitudes towards CPD were shaped by complex interrelationships between local structural and cultural factors within and between schools and teachers' career stage, age and subject affiliation.

(Adapted from Hustler et al., 2003, p. viii)
Respondents appeared to have a very traditional view of CPD: they rated course/conference and workshops first, followed by INSET days. Watching/talking with colleagues was third, with online learning the least likely to be pursued. The research team suggests that clear general differences appeared between younger/early stage teachers and older/late career teachers in their attitudes towards CPD. For example:

- 53 per cent under 25 years and 71 per cent 55+ years agreed that CPD generally met the needs of the school rather than them personally.
- 64 per cent under 25 years and 53 per cent 55+ years agreed that needs identified in their performance review had been met through CPD.
- 29 per cent under 25 years and 61 per cent 55+ years felt that they had played a part in setting the agenda in the school INSET days.
- 55 per cent under 25 years and 80 per cent 55+ years felt that too many training days were driven by national agendas.
- 36 per cent under 25 years and 33 per cent 55+ years believed that CPD providers thought of it mainly as a commercial activity.
- 81 per cent under 25 years and 75 per cent 55+ years thought they were given a real opportunity to improve their skills in the school.

Overall, as mentioned previously, many older teachers, across all stages, seemed to accept that CPD could not relate to their individual professional needs. In contrast, many younger teachers and newly qualified staff believed that CPD aimed at meeting systemic needs was reasonable, but also sought more personal CPD opportunities for individual development. In addition younger teachers displayed a broader understanding of and attitude towards, CPD. Some wanted CPD to focus on gaining subject knowledge, pedagogy and curriculum co-ordination and development. One female primary teacher, under 25 years, summed this up as: ‘[CPD should] improve key teaching skills and new teaching methods’. And another (female secondary teacher, under 25 years) reported that she ‘sometimes feels that training is wasted on things that are irrelevant to me’, thus highlighting the need for CPD to focus on the specific needs of teachers in the early stages.

2.4 Provision of CPD overseas

Europe

Eurydice, the information network on education in Europe (Eurydice, 2003), provides an overview of CPD for lower secondary school teachers in Europe. Although all the countries within the European Union offer in-service training opportunities for teachers at the lower secondary school stage, precisely what is on offer varies within and between countries. In some countries (eg parts of Belgium, Germany, the Netherlands, Austria, Finland, Sweden, the UK, Liechtenstein, Estonia, Latvia, Lithuania, Hungary, Malta and Romania) in-service training is compulsory for teachers at the lower secondary stage. In others (eg Spain, Portugal, Iceland, Bulgaria, Poland and Slovenia) it is officially optional, but in practice, teachers’ promotional prospects and salaries depend on their record of CPD. In many of the European countries, in-service training is organised during the teachers’ working day, with or without replacement cover for absence. Most compulsory in-service training is commonly offered before the start of the school term or at the end of the school year. The minimum annual time allocated for compulsory
in-service training also varies considerably across the European Union: from a minimum 12 hours per year in Latvia to 166 hours in the Netherlands. This compares with Scottish teachers who must undertake a minimum 5 days (35 hours) of CPD per year, plus 50 hours of planned activity time, some of which can be used for in-service education. In some European countries overall responsibility for in-service training lies with a central authority (e.g., a ministry of education or special council) but training is provided at regional or local levels. Increasingly, there is a tendency across Europe to devolve in-service training budgets to schools (e.g., Belgium, Italy, Sweden, the UK, Lithuania, and Hungary), which can then develop their own plans and select providers.

In-service education is organised by a variety of providers. In most European countries, this means either in higher education institutions and/or institutions for initial teacher education. Most countries also have institutions which are exclusively for in-service training; trade unions or teacher associations offer opportunities; and schools provide training directly, as do some adult education centres and private organisations. In several countries (Belgium, Italy, Austria, Finland, the UK, and Slovenia), teacher development focuses on school- or locally-based in-service training in order to facilitate access. In 11 countries, administration of training-related compensation is entirely decentralised, but management of budgets is devolved to either school or local levels. Training-related expenditure is paid in most countries where in-service is compulsory and in those where in-service is optional paid leave may be granted, often in combination with the payment of either training-related expenditure or payment of course fees. A total of 12 countries offer teachers sabbatical leave, which ranges from several weeks to a few years in length. (Opportunities for a 6-week sabbatical were introduced in England in 2001, but are available only for experienced teachers in challenging schools – defined as those in which at least 50 per cent of pupils are eligible for free school meals.)

The survey reports that the updating of teachers' subject knowledge and courses which accompany curricular reforms are the two most important aspects of CPD. Training providers also offer courses for cross-curricular knowledge and skills intended to facilitate the daily work of teachers and/or give them new directions for classroom practice. These include: teaching methodologies, use of information and communication technology (ICT), management/school development, special needs, multicultural teaching and conflict/behaviour management. All or most of these were offered in over half of the member or candidate countries of the European Union: ICT was a major topic in almost all countries. Unfortunately, difficulties were experienced in collecting national statistics about teachers' participation in CPD and, therefore, the picture is unreliable. In two countries where CPD was compulsory (Belgium and Malta), only half of teachers reportedly took part in in-service training, whereas in Norway, where CPD is optional, over 60 per cent of teachers apparently participated.

**Australia**

Writing in 1999, Barlow points out that although both Queensland and South Australia have statutory registration and periodic renewal of registration for teachers, re-registration is based upon the acceptability of teachers' qualification and fitness to teach, defined as the absence of convictions for any serious offence or dismissal from a teaching position. Neither included CPD at that date. He concludes (Barlow, 1999) that such arrangements would be unacceptable to many other professions (see Section 5 below), because such minimum renewal requirements do not satisfy a profession's desire to be seen to be responsible in the expectations it has of its members.

Despite not being compulsory, CPD is already a fundamental part of the professional lives of many Australian teachers. Ling and Mackenzie (2001) outline the different forms of professional development that may be taken by teachers in Australia. Some are in-house programmes, while others draw on outside experts or co-operative ventures with higher education institutions or outside bodies. In-house programmes usually focus on a specific initiative, curriculum policy or programme which has been identified by school staff. In contrast, universities offer professional
development modules, which may be combined for credit towards a formal university award. For example, teachers can undertake 15- to 18-hour modules from any university in Victoria to gain a Certificate of Education (Professional Development). The only requirement is that at least two of the four modules must be taken in the university from which the award is granted. These modules can be used to satisfy professional development requirements or for staff promotion and appraisal purposes. Professional development is also offered on 'Curriculum Days' or 'School Development Days' within schools. These are usually arranged once per term during which teachers address specific issues. Teachers also attend conferences and seminars and large subject association conferences are held annually. Teachers making presentations at such conferences can submit their paper for assessment towards a university award. Other opportunities include co-ordinated leadership programmes, action research projects and short courses. The researchers believe that the effectiveness of short courses is questionable and some states are discouraging such courses. They also think that there is considerable tension between teachers about how professional development should be offered: many think that long-term professional development is effective, agree that its organisation and content are two important indicators of effectiveness, but do not agree about the way it should be organised or its content. Many teachers felt that professional development was system-driven and that funding for it had been reduced.

Harris (2000) reports a research intervention with a sample of 38 teachers from New South Wales who were in the process of determining their own professional development needs – an essential starting point for professional development. Teachers in the sample participated in the 'Professional and Personal Life Plan' (PPLP), which consisted of a series of modules that enabled them to: formulate and appraise their needs, as they initially perceived them; be involved in a variety of strategies in their schools or with peers or mentors to validate their needs; and attend further workshops to formulate a development plan. The researcher concludes that teachers' needs are diverse and often inter-related; they have both professional and personal dimensions; and also reflect the needs of the teacher and the school. The process of formally identifying their professional development was new to many who participated in the study and also challenging.

Israel

Zuzovsky (2001) describes the three models of teachers' professional development to be found in Israel. The first, she defines as a classical model because it is based upon the academicisation of teacher education institutions begun in the 1970s. Following the recommendations of the Etzioni Committee, non-academic teacher education institutions were upgraded to academic institutions, able to offer Bachelor of Education (BEd) degrees to their graduates. Parallel to this reform, which immediately affected pre-service teacher education, practising teachers were encouraged to return to college and complete their BEd studies. By 1995, 10 per cent of teachers in kindergarten, 24 per cent in elementary and 60 per cent in junior high possessed academic degrees. The second model of teacher development regards teaching as a reflective practice in which knowledge is perceived to be practical, personal and embedded in teachers' work. As Zuzovsky points out '[this] model has eventually resulted in a decentralised policy that shifted the locus of teachers' professional development from institutes of higher education to schools' (p. 139). This has led to a proliferation of different school-based/school-focused models of professional development. Following a concurrent move towards school self-management, teachers' personal and professional development activities are often tied to collective school improvement goals. The third model of teachers' professional development is the individual (private) one that is encouraged and supported mainly by teachers' unions. This includes the establishment of several funds involving employees and employers from which individual teachers have the right to paid study leave (1 sabbatical year every 7 years) and numerous in-service studies. Zuzovsky reports that:
'The options that this has opened up for teachers are enormous and all teachers who belong to one of the two teachers' unions take advantage of the 'battery refill' sabbatical as well as the other opportunities for learning and development … this method enables individual teachers to control their career paths and to strengthen their professional image as they wish and to join other professionals from their community of practice'.

(Zuzovsky, 2001, p. 140)

USA

Two large-scale surveys provide a picture of CPD in the USA. First, in 1993, Davidson et al. (1993) undertook a survey of the National Staff Development Council's 5900 members to gather information about the status of staff development and staff developers in North America. The overwhelming majority of staff developers were mid-career and white, with the majority being female. Some 91 per cent were former teachers, but only 13 per cent currently taught in schools. Most were staff developers and nearly half reported directly to the superintendent of schools (equivalent to director of education). A total of 75 per cent indicated that their primary clients were teachers, but they also provided development for school principals, school counsellors and librarians, support staff, office personnel and parents. Staff development was delivered most frequently through workshops, followed by meetings and seminars. The most frequently used instructional methods were co-operative learning methods, videotapes and lectures. Little use of ICT was reported. Interestingly, most thought that support for staff development should be at least 3 per cent of the total school budget, but at that time four out of five school districts were reported not to support staff development to that level.

More recently, a study from the US National Centre for Education Statistics (NCES) (Lewis et al., 1999) explored the quality of the nation's teachers. Teacher preparation and qualifications were two of the criteria used by NCES to assess the quality of the teaching force. Questionnaires were mailed to a representative sample of 4049 full-time teachers in public elementary, middle and senior high schools in the 50 states and the District of Columbia. (Part-time and substitute teachers were excluded.) Virtually all teachers reported that they had participated in professional development activities (99 per cent) and at least one collaborative activity (95 per cent) in the past year. Participation in professional development activities typically lasted for 1–8 hours (ie 1 day or less of training). Areas of reform (eg implementing state or school district curricular changes, new technology, new assessment techniques) was the more usual focus of professional development. A total of 19 per cent of respondents reported that they had been mentored by another teacher. Teachers who participated in more professional development were likely to believe that CPD led to improvements in their teaching. The researchers found that length of teaching experience seemed to make little difference to teachers' participation in most areas of CPD. One exception was attendance at CPD events for classroom management, including student discipline, which unsurprisingly decreased with years of teaching experience, from 65 per cent of those with 3 or fewer years of experience to 43 per cent of those with 20 or more years. Interestingly, those with fewer years experience were more likely to participate in CPD about newer methods of teaching than those who had taught for 20 years or more. Teachers with 3 years or less were also more likely to have participated in CPD related to the in-depth study of the subject of their main teaching assignment and also in CPD programmes to help them address the needs of students with limited proficiency in English or from diverse cultural backgrounds.

2.5 Summary

- Teachers' CPD has been defined in various ways by different researchers. Most include elements of personal and professional growth for individual teachers; job-related practice;
teachers’ reflection upon practice within schools; and clarification of their professional values and roles (eg Bolam, 2000).

- Some (eg Bolam, 2000; McMahon, 1999) suggest that changes in the concept of CPD are a response to and reflection of changes in Government policy regarding raising standards and managerial accountability and also the devolution of CPD funding to school level.

- Other researchers have identified models based upon: input/output (Harland and Kinder, 1997); partnerships between stakeholders and HEIs (Eurydice, 2004); the creation of communities of learners (Clement and Vandenberghe, 2000; Thomas et al., 1998); an industrial apprenticeship model (Draper et al., 1991); technocratic models (Castle et al., 1998); and interactive/interconnected models (Ling and Mackenzie, 2001). However, most of the articles on models of CPD found during this search lack an evidential base.

- Hustler et al. (2003) provide the most recently published, comprehensive picture of CPD from a large sample of primary, secondary and special school teachers in schools in England. Their respondents generally identified CPD with courses, conferences and workshops and were largely satisfied. Teachers’ negative feelings were associated with a ‘one size fits all’ standardisation of CPD.

- CPD for teachers in lower secondary schools is compulsory in 14 countries within the European Union (Eurydice, 2003). This ranges from a minimum of 12 hours per year in Latvia to 166 hours in the Netherlands, compared with the 5 days (35 hours) of professional development required of Scottish teachers.

- In most European countries, CPD provision is offered by HEIs or institutions for initial teacher education. However, expenditure for teachers’ CPD has been devolved to school or local level in order to facilitate access. Twelve European countries offer teachers sabbatical leave, ranging from several weeks to a few years.

- Up-dating teachers’ subject knowledge and support for curricular reform were the most commonly reported topics for CPD among European teachers. Other topics included teaching methodologies, use of ICT, management, special needs, multicultural teaching and conflict/behaviour management.

- Evidence of practice in New South Wales, Australia, is provided by Ling and Mackenzie (2001), who argue that a dynamic interconnected model, in which provision is linked by a negotiated need or objective, is the most effective form of CPD. Clark and Hollingsworth (2002) report a similar conclusion.

- Rather unusually, teachers’ professional associations have joined with employers to fund a sabbatical year for Israeli teachers. These offer teachers the opportunity of a ‘battery refill’ (Zuzovsky, 2001).

- The US National Centre for Educational Statistics (Lewis et al., 1999) reports that 99 per cent of their sample of elementary, junior and senior high school teachers had participated in CPD activities during the previous year. Typically, these lasted 1–8 hours and focused on areas of reform of the curriculum.

- Only two of the research teams report differences in the provision, participation or attitudes of new teachers in CPD. First, Hustler et al. (2003) found that teachers under 25 (ie largely the less experienced) wanted CPD to focus on both personal and systemic needs; whereas older teachers seemed more ready to accept that CPD could not relate to their individual needs. Second, Lewis et al. (1999) report that inexperienced teachers were more likely to select CPD related to classroom management (reported by 65 per cent of those with 3 or fewer years experience, compared with 43 per cent of those with 20 or more years). In addition, they were more likely to participate in in-depth studies related to their main teaching assignment and programmes addressing the needs of students with limited proficiency in English or from diverse cultural backgrounds.
3 Early professional learning

3.1 Introduction

The main purpose of this review is to explore the literature on the development of teachers in the early stages of their professional careers, ie post-probation and up to 5 years of professional practice. Unfortunately, it appears to be an under-researched area and an ill-defined career-stage, in terms of the key words to describe it. Only 13 references emerged from our short list of 126 articles, which related to career development and ‘beginning teachers’. Furthermore, most of these articles refer to teacher development during the induction period, or report longitudinal studies, which provide only partial insights on the focus of the current review. The search also identified a number of ‘think pieces’, in which academics expound their perceptions of appropriate CPD, but few are based upon sound empirical studies. In this section we draw together the little evidence to emerge from these articles, that sheds some light on the topic of this review.

3.2 Stages of a teacher’s career

A number of papers describe the stages through which teachers’ careers are thought to develop. For example, Brighouse (1995) suggests that these are:

- Initial education and training of teachers
- From beginner teacher to established expert
- From early management to skilled leadership
- The consultant practitioner
- The teacher entering retirement.

He believes that for the beginner teacher to ‘fall into bad company has always been a hazard’ (p. 70). Being placed within a poor department in a poor school can be a catastrophe for an individual’s career, affect the newly qualified teacher’s self-esteem; and deprive the new teacher of essential support, counselling, encouragement and coaching and also of a perception of what it is like to be a successful teacher. Unfortunately no evidence is provided to support these assertions and although undesirable, it is possible for teachers to develop a commitment to their career even in the least promising working environment.

Fuller’s model of the evolution of teachers’ concerns (Fuller, 1969; Fuller and Brown, 1975) has been the starting point for much research on teacher development in the USA (see for example, Conway and Clark, 2003; Pigge and Marso, 1997). Some go so far as to suggest that Fuller’s model is ‘perhaps the most classic stage theory, in that it was meant to be relatively invariant, sequential and hierarchical’ (Richardson and Placier, quoted by Conway and Clark, 2003, p. 465). Basically, Fuller argues that teachers pass through three stages from novice to expert teacher, during which their concerns can be characterised as:

- **Stage 1: Self concerns**, primarily with survival as a teacher
- **Stage 2: Task concerns**, when concerns focus upon actual performance as teachers
- **Stage 3: Impact concerns**, when teachers’ focus shifts to having a meaningful and positive influence upon their pupils.
Fuller conceptualises teacher development as sequential and cumulative, but also points out that appropriate pre-service and in-service experiences are essential if teachers are to pass through these concern phases.

Fuller's model has influenced the direction of much research on teacher development. More recent empirical evidence is described in a 7-year longitudinal study of teachers in the USA (Pigge and Marso, 1997). The researchers followed a sample of 60 teachers from the commencement of teacher preparation in a Midwestern University through to the end of their fifth year in employment. Participants reported various personal and family characteristics, completed a batch of psychometric tests at different stages including the Comprehensive Test of Basic Skills (CTBS), a Teacher Concerns Questionnaire, Rotter's Locus of Control, Myers Briggs Type Indicator and the American College Test (ACT). The Teacher Concerns Questionnaire was repeated at the end of the teachers' third and fifth years of teaching. An analysis of self, task and impact concerns revealed statistically significant average differences between the task and self-scores as teachers developed, but not for impact scores. As Fuller had predicted, task concerns increased from the commencement of teacher preparation and self-concerns declined with teaching experience. However, unlike Fuller, Pigge and Marso report that impact concerns were high across all four career stages, indicating that this was a concern for all teachers at all stages of their development. Gender differences also emerged: the researchers report that female informants had significantly higher impact concerns than their male counterparts. Male teachers, regardless of their career stage, generally reported less concern than females about having a positive impact upon their pupils. Those teachers who had been good students expressed less concern about self-survival in teaching: the researchers believe that experiencing a high level of success as students may have lulled them into very low levels of self-concern. Ironically, the less able teachers reported abrupt declines in self- and impact concerns from the third to the fifth year of teaching; whereas the more capable teachers appeared to be experiencing what may be a continuing moderate decline in self concerns and an increase in impact concerns. As the researchers explain:

"Theoretically, one might speculate then that more capable successful teachers feel more concern about their impact upon pupils much further through their teaching career [than the less able teacher]."

(Pigge and Marso, 1997, p. 233)

Further evidence about the stages of teachers' development (but from teachers at an earlier stage of their development than the ones in which we are principally interested), is provided by Conway and Clark (2003). This study re-examines Fuller's widely cited model of teacher development by investigating a group of intern teachers during a two-semester internship programme at Michigan State University: it focuses on the patterns of interns' evolving concerns and aspirations. (Year-long internships in teaching have been adopted by a number of universities in the USA and offer an extended period of student teaching in a supportive atmosphere to trainee teachers, approximately equivalent to postgraduate certificate of education (PGCE) courses in the UK.) Six interns were interviewed about their hopes and fears three times, one-to-one and in focus groups in two school sites, over a 6-month period. The researchers suggest that their findings both support and extend Fuller's developmental model. Interns' concerns appeared to develop, as Fuller predicted, from self, to tasks, to students – described by Conway and Clark as 'a journey outward'. However, their concerns and aspirations also shifted from those about personal capacity to manage their classrooms, to concerns about their personal capacity to grow as a teacher and person, as their understanding of teaching and all it involves changed. The researchers suggest that this is a 'journey inward', which develops with heightened reflectivity and attention to development of self-as-teacher during the internship.
Another study from the USA, which highlights the developmental differences between inexperienced and experienced teachers’ perceptions of teaching, was undertaken by Allen and Casbergue (1997). The study aimed to prove or challenge the general consensus that reflectivity leads to professional growth by investigating the point at which teachers are able to accurately recall and reflect on their performance in the classroom. Their study was based upon the classroom observation of four newly qualified teachers (last year of a 4-year bachelor’s degree in education), five intermediate teachers (1 to 6.5 years of teaching) and four expert teachers (a minimum of 10 years experience) in actual elementary school classes in New Orleans. All teachers were observed and videotaped by the researchers, as they taught for one period. Immediately following the observation, a structured interview was conducted to determine the level of teachers’ recall of their own and their pupils’ behaviour within the classroom. The researchers reported that new teachers’ recall was usually accurate, but some displayed inaccuracies about whether their pupils were on/off task. Newly qualified teachers tended to recall more of their own behaviour than their pupils’ behaviour. In contrast, intermediate teachers recalled substantially more of both their own and their students’ behaviours. Newly qualified teachers stated that they focused on their role and the content of the lesson, whereas intermediate teachers concentrated on the students’ understanding of the concepts being taught. With increased experience, the expert group recalled fewer specific incidents, but were able to display a more holistic approach to the realisation of their objectives. The researchers concluded that teachers progress in thoroughness of recall along different paths and at different rates and cognisance should be taken of this in planning reflective-oriented teacher education/in-service programmes. Of particular interest to this current review is their claim that the development of pedagogical schemata are related to differences in patterns of fluidity, certainty, consistency and holistic recall and that:

'It is reasonable to theorize that a certain level of experience is necessary before sufficient pedagogical schemata develop and subsequently become well connected, rendering teaching behaviours rather automatic and allowing teachers to focus primarily on their students’.

(Allen and Carsbergue, 1997, p. 751)

Further evidence of the development of beginner teachers’ identities is provided by research from the Victoria Institute of Teaching (White and Moss, 2003). The researchers undertook a study of 60 beginning teachers and a micro-study of the ‘internship’ experiences of teacher educators. They argue that the transition from pre-service training to being an employed teacher is fraught with difficulties. Others have portrayed this as a process of gaining ‘technical competence’ and described the problems and deficits of the beginner teacher. By focusing on beginner teachers’ stories, White and Moss identify the ‘silent rage’ felt by many of their sample of new teachers and report that ‘while grappling with issues of professional identity, these teachers have been astounded at both the complexity of teaching and the lack of professionalism in the profession’ (White and Moss, 2003, p. 6). One of their informants explains how he:

'Expected it [his first job] to be easy and it’s incredibly difficult. And I just wasn’t prepared for that from my Dip Ed. And that really surprised me … and then there was this … all this stuff that I just couldn’t do … way too hard for me. I’m giving it up … I just can’t believe how difficult it is’

(White and Moss, 2003, p. 6)

In order to prepare students for being newly qualified teachers, the researchers conclude that it is important for teacher educators to map the culture of their own and pre-service and beginning teachers’ identities and explore the values that guide action so as to foster a link between identity,
agency and practice. They hope that this will prevent beginner teachers forming discordant identities in the early years of their professional development.

3.3 Factors influencing teachers’ careers

Several articles explore factors that influence teachers’ careers (Flores, 2001; Gay and Ryan, 1996; Hammond, 2001, 2002; Kelchtermans, 1993). Kelchtermans utilised the biography method to follow the career paths of ten Belgian primary school teachers. The research aimed to understand teachers’ professional development by studying their career stories and analysing the narratives in order to reconstruct the professional self and subjective educational theory, both of which were conceived of as indicators of professional development. Kelchtermans (1993) argues that teacher’s professional self develops from a combination of self-image, self-esteem, job motivation, task perception and future perspectives. Comparative analysis of teachers’ accounts of their careers revealed two important recurring themes: first, the strive for job stability; and, second, the feelings of vulnerability experienced by all informants in the study. Of particular interest to career development is the notion of ‘critical incidents’ both positive and negative, which informants reported affected their career decision making. For example, one reports that having a child who experienced learning difficulties led the teacher to specialise in special needs; and lack of job satisfaction resulted in another taking an interest in the school library and part-time journalism. Unfortunately, Kelchterman’s sample was composed exclusively of experienced teachers and, therefore, falls outwith the remit of this current study.

The centrality of the school experience as a factor which influences beginner teachers’ career decision making is provided by Johnson and Birkeland (2002). The researchers report findings from a longitudinal interview study of 50 new teachers in Massachusetts. It identifies respondents’ reasons for staying in their schools, moving to new schools, or leaving public school teaching within 3 years of entering the profession. By the end of the third year of the study, 11 of the original sample of 50 teachers had left public school teaching altogether – six after their first year, four after their second year and one after her third year. Eleven of the sample moved schools, of whom six changed school district. Some 28 respondents (56 per cent) were still working in the school where they started teaching, but 15 of these were dissatisfied either with their school or their career. Mature entrants from other jobs were more than three times as likely to leave as first career teachers: the researchers believe that they were less tolerant of schools that did not support good teaching. Although respondents’ prior career orientation, financial situation and preparation played a role in their career decisions, their experiences within schools were central in influencing their decisions. Teachers who felt successful with students and whose schools were organised to support them in their teaching – by providing collegial interaction, opportunities for growth, appropriate assignments, adequate resources and schoolwide structures supporting student learning – were more likely to stay in their schools and in teaching, than teachers whose schools were not so organised.

A study of Australian teachers gives additional insights into the development of young teachers’ career intentions. Gay and Ryan (1996) examined the reasons young teachers give for staying in teaching or leaving schools in Melbourne. The information was gathered through interviews with 32 of the 51 graduates from the 1989 Diploma of Teaching (Primary) course at Footscray Institute of Technology, Melbourne, Victoria. Informants mentioned five aspects of teaching that gave them satisfaction: autonomy, responsibility, recognition, enjoyment (of work and of children) and children’s achievement. The overwhelming number of teachers in the study cited the delight they took in children’s achievement as the major source of satisfaction, eg

'Don’t do it for the money; it’s that love of teaching'.

'If we ever lost that love, we would quit teaching'.

26
‘Seeing the development and enjoyment of children in the classroom’.

‘Seeing kids learning and producing really good work and you know that has a lot to do with you. Get a real buzz when my kids pick up something’.

In comparison, the main causes of dissatisfaction were: changed expectation, lack of recognition and children with problems. By far the most frequently expressed source (39 statements) concerned changes made by the Directorate of School Education, which impacted on teachers’ workload and the school curriculum, eg:

‘They’re [the Directorate] changing the system all the time …the government stuff is most frustrating’.

‘Cuts have hit the school hard with loss of teachers. Teaching has become really hectic’.

‘The workload is more hectic, more demanding with growing class sizes’.

The researchers suggest that the growth of dissatisfying factors leads to new teachers wishing to leave the profession.

Flores (2001) provides more evidence of influences on teachers’ careers from a study of beginner teachers in northern Portugal. The researcher examines the development of 14 teachers in six schools (four elementary and two secondary schools) during 1999/2000. Data were gathered through semi-structured interviews with beginners and questionnaires to all staff (n=285). Although the study focuses on the first year of teaching, which is outwith our concern, it provides interesting insights into how biographical and contextual factors influence a beginner teacher’s development. Most informants (10 out of 14) cited extrinsic motivation for entering teaching, such as employment opportunities, having a secure stable job and the influence of significant others, eg relatives or former teachers. Informants used terms such as ‘jump’, ‘shock’ and ‘barrier’ to describe the gap between their expectations and the reality of becoming a teacher. Rather surprisingly, within the whole sample the researchers found no statistically significant differences in teachers’ attitudes towards professional development according to the age or years of experience of respondents. A total of 75 per cent did not think that teachers’ professional learning took place during their initial teacher education; nor during teaching practice (59 per cent). Beginner teachers strongly believed that professional learning comes mostly from experience, ie learning by doing, making decisions about teaching and other job-related roles. The research highlights the strong effect of workplace conditions in shaping beginning teachers’ practices and attitudes towards teaching and the researcher concludes that, if a ‘learning culture’ is to be fostered in schools, more importance must be given to the structural and organisational factors of the workplace.

Hammond (2001, 2002) reports on the experiences of a cohort of nine ICT teachers after their second year of teaching in secondary schools in England. All had completed the 1-year PGCE in an English university in 1999; six were female and three male and their ages ranged from 24 to 47. Some had moved school during the first 2 years, and others had taken on a variety of responsibilities. During the first year of the study, beginner teachers continued to be positive about their decision to teach and saw relationships with students as the main source of their professional satisfaction. All felt better in their second year, confident in their subject knowledge and better able to plan and manage pupils’ learning. Five thought that the start of their second year represented a ‘step change’, a significant jump in their confidence and performance. Their biggest source of dissatisfaction was work overload provoked by the demands of managing students’ coursework. As one student explained:
...this year I found having a life and marking the coursework was impossible. I was working from eight in the evening until one in the morning by the time it [assessment] was all sorted with. It was a month living like that. Next year I'm going to stagger the deadlines'.

(Hammond, 2002, p. 231)

Another referred to the role played by more experienced staff and described how when he submitted the marks for student course work:

'The head of department wanted to go over them again as they were too good in his eyes. I could have walked out, he didn't trust me. But I had been pushing the pupils to achieve and after he went through the work he accepted the marks were in order'.

(Hammond, 2002, p. 231)

Overall, members of the group became more relaxed as teachers in their second year. They mentioned improvements in their:

- subject knowledge
- knowledge of students
- reaction to events
- assertiveness in managing the classes; and
- control of their own emotions, which reduced the likelihood of confrontations.

They were also aware of a change in their status, as they ceased to be newly qualified teachers (NQTs). All were still motivated to teach, derived considerable satisfaction from working with young people and were sufficiently confident to adopt both a ‘relaxed’ and ‘stern’ approach to class management.

3.4 Meeting beginner teachers’ developmental needs

Six studies relating to CPD for beginner teachers were located: two (Burns et al., 2000; Ginns et al., 2001) are concerned with student learning during the PGCE course or first year of practice; one (Brighouse, 1995) is a ‘think piece’; another (Bubb, 2004) offers advice to newly qualified teachers; and two (Kearns, 2001; Killeavy, 2001) relate directly to the subject of this review.

Some evidence suggests that newly qualified teachers’ concepts of teaching begin long before they are employed in schools: Burns et al. (2000) chart this development from when students begin their initial teacher training. They describe the Developing Expertise of Beginning Teachers project which aimed to explore the learning of beginning teachers on a 1-year Postgraduate Certificate of Education (PGCE) course in a well-established partnership scheme, through to their second year of practice. Some 36 participants, who were being trained to teach secondary English, mathematics or science (the three core subjects of the compulsory National Curriculum in England), were recruited from education departments in two English universities. The student teachers were videotaped on four occasions during the year and interviewed after filming to explore their thinking in relation to their practice. All the student teachers talked about what they were trying to achieve in the sampled lessons. Some included aims, which resulted from their position as newly qualified teachers, eg ’pupil knowledge’ and ’self-knowledge’. However, as the researchers pointed out, student teachers were able to go beyond ‘concerns with self’. They demonstrated a high level of concern for pupil learning, echoed in their lesson evaluations and a surprisingly sophisticated grasp of the complexity of teaching. They were aware of the wide range of factors which impinge on teaching and these appeared to have influenced the decisions which
the student teachers took and the way in which they evaluated pupil outcomes and their own performance. Although this project focused on trainee teachers, it has implications for the development of inexperienced teachers. The researchers point out that on-going support in schools, e.g. mentoring and feedback, should take account of beginner teachers’ ability to assess the complexity of the teaching situation. It can be:

‘Very easy to jump in with critical advice or helpful suggestions that fail to acknowledge the careful deliberation that preceded the lesson and the insights which the student teachers may already have gained from the experience. A structure for post-lesson debriefing that encourages the student teachers to give their own account of the strengths and weaknesses of the lesson will not only give those working with them a better understanding of the trainees’ perceptions, but also help to establish habits of critical evaluation that will serve the new teachers beyond the training year’.

(Burns, 2000, p. 277)

Ginns et al. (2001) describe an action research project which aimed to help a group of beginner primary school teachers in Queensland, Australia to develop their understanding of teaching. The researchers follow Whyte et al.’s definition of participatory action research (PAR) as that in which ‘some of the people in the organisation or community under study participate actively with the professional researcher throughout the research process from the initial design to the final presentation of results and discussion of their action implications’ (Whyte et al., 1991, p. 20). The participants in the study included nine beginner teachers and four university academics. The teachers were recent graduates from a 4-year BEd primary course in Brisbane; five taught in schools in Queensland, two in Northern Territory and one in New South Wales. Together they formed a network of people and action research projects, operating in ‘cells’. Each beginner teacher conducted an action research project supported by their cell’s facilitator and shared their findings with other cell members. The researchers report mixed results which have implications for the use of action research for staff development. They conclude that:

‘Clearly the participatory, social and collaborative attributes of PAR [participatory action research] have fostered professional growth, although some limitations and constraints to that growth were evident in the data collected. Very few of the teachers appeared to experience the critical and emancipatory attributes of PAR with their concerns continuing to focus on the technical aspects of teaching throughout the year, rather than taking control over their actions and thinking … Security and support was the essential factor early in the study. However, the failure of the teachers to become critical and emancipatory may relate to their stage of development. Survival was paramount and a social justice or critical perspective on the power structures and culture of the schools may have been deliberately de-emphasized in their reflections’.

(Ginns et al., 2001, p. 129)

Two articles, which are not research-based, offer views or advice on appropriate CPD. Brighouse (1995) argues that to ensure the continuing development of new teachers, they should be expected to study for an MA (in teaching and learning) to be accomplished after 5 or 6 years in the profession. Bubb (2004), in a guide for new teachers, suggests that they must know when to ask for help. She quotes an assistant headteacher in a community school in Walsall who ensures that new teachers know that ‘almost everything that we have to teach has been taught thousands of times before so there is no need to reinvent the wheel. But people [other staff] aren’t psychic’, so new teachers need to communicate with other more experienced staff. She also points out that newly qualified teachers need to think about how children at different ages learn and what is the
best way to teach them. One way to learn how to do this is by observing effective colleagues in
the school in which the newly qualified teacher teaches, or in another school. New teachers also
need subject knowledge:

‘[T]o teach anything well, you need to know what you are talking about, to be prepared for
those weird questions that some children ask, as well as all those misunderstandings you
didn’t think were possible … if you’re only ever one page ahead of children, you’ll find
yourself in deep water’.

(Bubb, 2004, p. 1)

Two projects, which relate directly to beginner teachers participation in CPD, are reported by
Kearns (2001) and Killeavy (2001). Kearns (2001) reports research from Northern Ireland, which
records beginner teachers’ experience of the Early Professional Development programme, introduced
in 1998. The programme includes integrated partnerships (between HEIs, Education and Library
Boards and schools) and a competence-based framework for teacher education based upon five
areas of competence:

‘Understanding the curriculum and professional knowledge
Subject knowledge and subject application
Teaching strategies and techniques
Classroom management, assessment and recording of pupil progress
Foundation for further professional development’

(Kearns, 2001, p. 66)

These are intended to inform teacher development at all stages from initial, through to induction
and CPD. HEIs are expected to take the lead for initial training; Education and Library Boards
during induction; with schools becoming the lead partner during the second and third years of
early professional development. Data were gathered from interviews with a representative sample
of beginner teachers (n=20) from BEd and PGCE courses in 1997 and 1998 and from a
questionnaire survey of the entire cohort of graduates from one university (n=347; response rate,
15 per cent). Interviews were conducted March–June 2000, when the beginner teachers were in
either their second or third years of practice. The researcher found that the development of
writing, pupil behaviour, reading and aspects of the religious education curriculum together
accounted for approximately 56 per cent of the new teachers’ first portfolios of evidence of
Professional Development Activity (PDA), which all new teachers must submit under the
scheme. Some 62 per cent of portfolios mentioned ICT as a subsidiary focus. Beginner teachers
indicated that their choice of subject reflected: a school priority (50 per cent); personal interests
(27 per cent) and pupil needs (22 per cent). The researcher notes that:

‘The range of topics chosen in the majority of PDAs appear to focus, not upon acquiring
target teaching competences, but predictably upon trialling lessons, extending lesson
repertoires or demonstrating curriculum development that respond to DENI [Department
of Education for Northern Ireland] strategic priorities, or the needs of the school or class’.

(Kearns, 2001, p. 78)

Although there is no necessary conflict between the chosen topics and the newly introduced
competence framework, the researcher argues that in practice, the framework does not appear to
be the scaffolding around which beginner teachers build their development plans. Teacher tutors,
school principals and heads of department were the major source of support for beginner
teachers and less than half of the beginner teachers in the survey indicated their intention to seek HEI accreditation for their PDAs. In addition, the majority felt that it was unfair that they should be expected to pay for the accreditation and believed that it should be free to those who successfully completed the process.

Another study which sheds light on the CPD chosen by beginner teachers was conducted by Killeavy (2001). The research examined the professional development of a year group of 183 BEd graduates from one Irish college of education during the first 10 years of their careers as primary school teachers. It focuses on their experiences of the induction process and their career profile in terms of progress and retention within the profession. Data were gathered in 1998 using a series of questionnaires (response rate 82 per cent). Reflecting on their progress at the end of their second year, three-quarters of respondents (75 per cent) believed that they had managed their first 2 years of teaching well, despite the fact that two-thirds reported that they had been left to their own devices during their early teaching careers. The most common area of difficulty cited by respondents was classroom management (22 per cent). Some 10 years after graduation, 82 per cent had secured permanent teaching positions; 10 per cent were school principals and 6 per cent held other posts of responsibility. A total of 10 per cent had left teaching and 17 per cent could not be traced. A total of 84 per cent of respondents had been involved in short in-service courses. Of significance, the researcher found that:

"Those teachers who took part in in-service training performed significantly less well that those individuals who had no such involvement, both in terms of points awarded in the Leaving Certificate examination and in terms of academic attainment in the BEd degree. It seems, therefore, that the more academically proficient teachers in the cohort place considerably less value on the merits of in-service than their less academic peers". (Killeavy, 2001, p. 125)

As might be expected, teachers who undertook postgraduate degrees during their first 10 years of teaching (10 per cent) had outperformed their classmates in the BEd examinations in History of Education, Sociology of Education and in their practical teaching performance. The researcher points out that the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development has criticised Irish education for the paucity of induction provision for new teachers and despite the creation of the In-career Development Unit of the Department of Education and Science, there was no evidence that any constructive induction programme was available to the young teachers in this study. Killeavy reflects on the long standing dilemma in teacher education of how to develop "in parallel the ability to understand teaching and to perform teaching among beginner teachers" (p. 131) and suggests that beginner teachers should be encouraged to develop the facility to ‘contextualise theory and to conceptualise practice’ (p. 131). No clues as to how this might be achieved are offered by this research.

### 3.5 Summary

Teachers’ early professional learning is an under-researched area and an ill-defined career-stage in terms of the key words to describe it: only 13 references emerged from our short list of 126 articles which related to career development and ‘beginning teachers’. Furthermore, most of these articles were concerned with the induction period. From the available evidence, we found that:

- A number of papers describe the stages which teachers are thought to pass through as they develop their careers. Brighouse (1995) suggests there are five stages: initial education and training, beginner teacher to established expert, early management to established expert, consultant practitioner and teacher entering retirement.
Other researchers identify distinct developmental concerns associated with different phases of a teacher’s career. For example, Fuller (1969; Fuller and Brown, 1975) suggests that these are: concerns with self (primarily survival as a teacher); task concerns which focus on actual performance as teachers; and impact concerns relating to positive influence upon their pupils.

More recent evidence of teachers’ developmental concerns is presented by Pigge and Marso (1997) and Conway and Clark (2003). Both studies in the USA largely support and extend Fuller’s analysis. Specifically, Pigge and Marso report that although task concerns increase with experience, impact concerns were high throughout. Conway and Clark support Fuller’s model of a ‘journey outward’ but also found that new teachers’ concerns deepen on an ‘inward journey’ at the same time, heightening reflectivity and attention to self-development.

More evidence of new teachers’ development of their concept of self is provided by Allen and Casbergue (1997) and Flores (2001). Allen and Casbergue’s (1997) study in the USA claims that although ability to recall events in the classroom generally increased with experience, more experienced teachers were able to adopt a more holistic approach in terms of the realisation of their teaching objectives. The strong impact of the workplace on the development of beginner teachers’ identity as teachers was reported by Flores (2001) from a study of new teachers in Portugal.

Factors influencing the careers of experienced teachers were identified by Kelchtermans (1993). He reports a desire for stability and a feeling of vulnerability among primary teachers in Belgium.

Factors which influence the careers of beginner teachers tend to focus on job satisfaction and support. A study of beginner teachers in Massachusetts public schools (Johnson and Birkeland, 2003) reports that those teachers who felt successful and believed that they were supported in their schools were more likely to remain in the profession. In Melbourne, Gay and Ryan (1996) found that new teachers remained in the profession because they liked the job but were dissatisfied with the number of changes and the workload.

Two studies suggest ways in which CPD should be provided for beginner teachers. Burns et al. (2000) found a high level of pupil knowledge amongst trainee teachers, which has implications for later developments and Brighouse (1995) suggests that all beginners should undertake an MA in Education as part of their early professional development.

Three studies focus on the nature of CPD undertaken by inexperienced teachers. Ginns et al. (2001) reports how action research was only partially successful with beginner teachers because they were unable to look beyond concerns with survival and classroom management. Kearns (2001) found that a sample of primary school teachers in their second or third year of practice in Northern Ireland had chosen Professional Development Activities in writing, pupil behaviour, reading and aspects of the religious curriculum. ICT was a subsidiary interest in 62 per cent of development portfolios. In contrast, Killeavy (2001) reports from a study of graduates who entered the profession in Ireland 10 years ago, that those who had performed less well in the Leaving Certificate examinations and academically in the BEd degree were more likely to participate in in-service education.
4 Scottish evidence

4.1 Introduction

There is some published evidence on Scottish teachers’ views on continuing professional development (Deloitte and Touche, 1999; MVA, 1999; SEED, 2000), but the literature search revealed no published studies relating directly to teachers’ early professional learning, following the completion of their compulsory probationary period. In total, 14 articles were identified, which mentioned CPD in a Scottish context, but these report findings from general surveys of CPD or studies of teachers’ development during probation. In order to gain some insight into Scottish teachers’ views of CPD in the early years, we have had to relax the inclusion/exclusion criteria established for this review and we report below what little can be drawn from available Scottish evidence.

4.2 The Scottish context

The context for the development of CPD in Scottish education is set by Ross (1996), who describes how staff development in secondary education developed through a series of phases between 1975 and 1990. He argues that at the start of the period, staff development was relatively informal, dependent upon the motivation and commitment of the individual teacher, but later it developed into a more collegial approach, until finally it became a function of management and responsive to central control. As late as 1999, Marker suggests that:

‘In practice professional development has been one of the poor relations of the education service. Teachers have not been willing to campaign for it at the expense of salaries or class size; the authorities have regularly had to sacrifice it to meet their statutory responsibilities; successive governments have advocated it without providing the necessary resources …’

(Marker, 1999, p. 924)

Humes (2001) believes that the year 2000 was a ‘watershed in the evolution of Scottish education’ (p. 6). He argues that the McCrone Report (Scottish Executive, 2000) and the settlement, which followed, changed the picture, as did the subsequent development of a national framework for Continuing Professional Development.

Purdon (2001, 2003) alludes to two developments which she believes set the policy context for CPD in Scottish schools: first, the Standards in Scotland’s Schools etc Act (2000) made statutory provision for the GTCS to expand its remit to consider ‘career development’ (Amendment to Section 1, Sub-section 2A of the Teaching Council Scotland Act 1965) and second, the Inquiry into Professional Conditions of Service for Teachers (SEED, 2000) (known as the McCrone Report) created a new CPD framework in which professional standards were defined at three levels, ie the Standard for Full Registration, the Standard for Chartered Teacher and the existing Standard for Headship. The agreement recognised the importance of CPD, both as a professional entitlement and a professional obligation and teachers accepted an additional 35 hours of CPD per annum and were encouraged to maintain personal CPD profiles. Concomitantly, work was already underway between the GTCS and the SEED to produce a national framework for the support and assessment of new teachers during their induction period. These two initiatives provide the immediate background for the current review. Although both emphasise CPD, neither makes specific reference to CPD in the early years of professional development, ie post probation.

In addition, it should be noted that the Scottish Executive has established national priorities and targets for Scottish education, Target 6 of which (Scottish Executive Budget 2005–2006)
includes ‘full implementation of the national agreement on teachers’ pay and conditions (A Teaching Professional for the 21st Century) by 2006’.

4.3 Early professional learning opportunities

In 2000, Livingston and Robertson (2001) identified seven main forms of CPD for teachers in Scotland. These are:

- Teacher Education Institution Postgraduate Courses
- Teacher Education Institution Short Courses
- Teacher Education Institution School-based Consultancy
- Education Authority Staff Development Programmes
- Traditional University Masters Programmes
- Open University Undergraduate Courses
- Open University Postgraduate Courses in Education

(Livingston and Robertson, 2001, p. 188)

As can be seen, all of these focus largely on formal CPD and ignore informal teacher-led school-based learning opportunities, although the authors do allude to changes which may occur as a formal national framework for CPD is agreed. In addition, no mention is made of the specific needs of teachers in the early years of their professional development. We found no published evidence that Higher Education Institutions (HEIs) or Education Authorities (EAs) in Scotland are providing CPD specifically tailored to meet the continuing development needs of post-probationary teachers. In fact, such confusion existed around the term ‘early professional learning’ that most Education Authorities responding to our request to provide copies of policies or opportunities for CPD in the early years excluding probation, forwarded their authority’s plans for development during the probationary period. Of the 32 Education Authorities (EA) approached, only six sent documentation. One reported that:

‘In terms of CPD, we [the authority] are in recovery from a low position in recent years. Early years development is something we hope to develop as a separate part of the CPD framework’.

(EA 4)

There is some evidence that some authorities are beginning to address the needs of newly qualified teachers. However, they may consider the first 5 years of professional practice to be an entity rather than differentiate pre- and post-probation. One, for example indicates that:

‘We [the authority] are at present, at the consultation stage of putting together a five year CPD programme for those from induction up to 5 years. This will be operational as of August 2004’.

(EA 1)

One authority (EA 6) reported that its support officer was updating policy guidelines for use in schools next session and this would include information relating to CPD provision at both school and authority level. Another authority (EA 2) had appointed an employee support advisor, who was available to offer support, for example on stress, to all the authority’s employees.

The absence of formal policies and provision does not mean that new teachers in Scottish schools are necessarily deprived of development opportunities: it is reasonable to assume that all
will be experiencing on-the-job informal learning and may also be supported in different schools by more formalised arrangements, such as co-teaching, mentoring, coaching, shadowing, planned activities and in-service at individual, departmental or school levels. However, we could find no evidence to show the extent to which these activities support teachers in their early professional lives. As one authority explained:

‘Basically, so far teachers who have completed their induction year have the same opportunities to access CPD as their more experienced colleagues. This would take place in the Professional Review and Development process with their line manager and they would have the opportunity to discuss future development needs in connection with the schools development plan and their own professional development. It would then be determined the type of development required, ie in-service training, work shadowing, working group membership and ways of addressing this would be sought out’.

(EA 3)

4.4 Who participates in CPD?

Published information about teachers’ participation in CPD in Scotland is now rather dated and also sheds little light on early professional learning. For example, O’Brien and McGettrick (1995) surveyed principal teachers in 51 secondary schools throughout Scotland about their views on what forms of CPD can best support teachers during times of curriculum change. And in 1999, MVA (SOEID, 1999) undertook a survey, on behalf of the Scottish Office Education and Industry Department (SOEID), of teachers’ continuing professional development. The aim was to provide a ‘map’ of teachers uptake of CPD, by specifically investigating the topics, methods and providers; the amounts of money spent on CPD; any perceived benefits and the criteria used by teachers to assess the effectiveness and value for money of CPD. Staff in 300 schools (primary, secondary and special) were interviewed by telephone to gauge their experience and opinions of CPD. The schools surveyed covered 15 education authorities and information was also collected from relevant education authorities themselves, relating to their CPD policies and guidance given to schools. Although the research does not report the breakdown of respondents by their length of service in teaching, a general picture of CPD emerges. The researchers argue that the devolution of varying proportions of the staff development budget to school level (ranging from 33 per cent to 86 per cent) is the most important change to have occurred. Education authorities most frequently disbursed funding based upon a set amount per teacher, often with an additional supplement for particular developments and supplements for small schools. Staff cover was most frequently the largest type of purchase made by schools, ie on average, 43 per cent of CPD expenditure; compared with course fees, which were on average, 38 per cent of CPD expenditure. School priorities, education authority priorities, national initiatives and teachers’ requests were all frequently stated as influencing the choice of staff training and development. Schools mentioned a wide variety of providers, but 71 per cent of respondents thought that training offered by education authorities usually represented the best value for money. The majority of respondents agreed that since devolution of budgets:

- schools have put more thought into choosing staff training and development (98 per cent)
- the needs of individual staff are met more responsibly (88 per cent)
- providers are more likely to stay in touch with what is happening on the ground (79 per cent)
- the Education Authority is more effective in providing training which meets the needs of the school.
CPD can also be associated with curricular reform and specific initiatives. An example is provided by Powney et al. (2001), who report staff views on the training provided during the implementation of the Early Intervention Programme in Highland Region. Headteachers, teachers and classroom assistants all felt that the success of the Early Intervention Programme had been largely due to it being 'supported by an integrated and planned programme of in-service training' (p. iii). Training was perceived to foster greater communications within and between schools and also between schools and parents. However, again no mention is made of the training being tailored to the needs of staff in the early stages of their careers.

4.5 Teachers’ views of early years of professional development?

Previous studies have tended to focus on the experiences of teachers at the beginning of their careers. The most extensive was the Scottish Study of Probationers, 1988–1991 and 1995–1996 (Draper et al., 1991, 1997, 1998). The research team explored the views of different cohorts of teachers as they moved through their probationary period. The researchers believed that professional development should be a career-long feature of teaching and anticipated finding that positive attitudes to it would be central to the early experiences of new teachers. However, their findings report probationer teachers believed that they spent more time proving that they could do their jobs rather than developing their practice. In addition, the researchers argued that the increasing number of teachers who completed their probation on a series of temporary contracts is likely to threaten the development potential of the early years. The second cohort in 1995/6 was more satisfied with their professional development experiences than probationers had been five years earlier, but unsurprisingly, those with broken employment patterns reported lower levels of satisfaction but higher levels of development. The researchers suggest two alternative interpretations: either uncertain employment is a ‘trial by fire’ (p. 283), which enhances development; or disrupted employment leads to a narrower perception of teaching and teachers’ professional development. Unfortunately, none of these studies refers specifically to the post-probation period but all point to how the experiences of probation may continue to influence teachers’ perceptions of continuing professional development at a later stage. As one of their respondents commented:

‘The effect of short-term contracts on initially keen and dedicated staff is disastrous. Morale, dedication and professionalism quickly evaporate’.

(Draper et al., 1997, p. 294)

The current arrangements for probation agreed with local authorities should have largely overcome this problem.

More recently, Purdon (2000) undertook a small-scale study, which focused specifically on new teachers’ perspectives on continuing professional development. This provides additional evidence of teachers’ developing views in the early years of their professional practice. The researcher surveyed a random sample of 10 per cent (420) of the 4208 teachers who had gained their teaching qualification within the previous two years and were provisionally registered with the GTCS. She reports that 91 per cent of the sample thought that ‘having a commitment to career-long professional development’ was central to the concept of professionalism. ‘New teachers in the study appeared to view CPD and any related accreditation and recording, as being essentially related to accountability and not for professional growth, deeper job satisfaction or contribution to profession-wide development’ (Purdon, 2000, p. 120). Unfortunately, only 50 (12 per cent) of the sample chose to respond, so caution must be taken generalising these findings.
4.6 On-going research in this area

As can be seen from the above sections, there is very little published research which refers specifically to the early years of teachers’ professional development in Scotland. However, the Economic and Social Research Council (ESRC) has recently commissioned a very large-scale study of Enhanced Competence-based Learning in Early Professional Development (McNally et al., on-going) as part of the Teaching and Learning Research Programme. The project began in January 2004 but is not due to be completed until January 2008. It aims to improve the learning of new professionals by developing, evaluating and disseminating a research-based, practical model of early professional learning. The researchers anticipate that the model will initially be developed and tested with secondary teachers before subsequent adaptation to accommodate different contexts of teaching and of other professions. They hope that it will add value to previous approaches to early professional development by providing a more comprehensive analysis of what and how new professionals actually learn. The researchers point out that common-sense notions of what the development needs of inexperienced teachers are deemed to be, will be enhanced by integrating outcome-orientated competences with context; and identity formation and the process of informal learning, which they argue recent research shows to be crucial in the early experience of the beginning professional.

The researchers plan is to track the development of around 500 teachers, initially secondary school teachers in Scotland but later extending to the primary sector and also to England, through collaboration with researchers at Manchester Metropolitan University. As different cohorts join the study at various stages, not all will be tracked for the same period of time. However, the first cohort of teachers will be followed from when they enter the profession to the end of their third year – thus providing an overlap with the group with which this current review is concerned. Unfortunately, as this project has only recently begun, published findings cannot be expected for another year or two.

4.7 Summary

Little evidence relating specifically to the development of teachers in Scottish schools during the early years of their professional practice was identified. The main conclusions we draw are:

- No completed studies of teachers’ early professional learning (ie post-probation) in Scotland were identified.
- Ross (1996) suggests that staff development in secondary education has developed from a focus on individual teachers to become a function of management and responsive to central control.
- Humes argues that the year 2000 marked a ‘watershed’, with the publication of the McCrone report and the subsequent development of a national framework for CPD.
- No Scottish education authority provided evidence that it had developed policies or provision for teachers in the early years of their professional development: one reported that it was currently consulting on a policy which would cover the first 5 years of professional practice.
- Available evidence on participation in CPD among Scottish teachers (O’Brien and McGettrick, 1995; MVA, 1999) does not provide a breakdown of the results by the length of experience of the participants.

Purdon (2000) found that 91 per cent of teachers who had qualified in the previous 2 years thought that ‘having a commitment to career-long professional development’ was central to the concept of professionalism.

A very large study of early professional learning, part of the ESRC Teaching and Learning Research Programme, has been commissioned (McNally et al., on-going), but this will not report until 2008.
5 Developments in other professions

5.1 Introduction

A number of researchers have sought to compare approaches to initial training and continuing professional development in other professions with the way teachers are developed (eg Barlow, 1999; Booth et al., 1995; Castle et al., 1998). Their primary aim is to gain insights which may be useful to those engaged in developing teachers. However, most admit that there are limits to such comparisons: the history, contexts, training and career patterns, models and modes of delivery of different professions vary. Some have incorporated the concept of compulsory CPD as a necessary step to gaining ‘a license to practise’; while others operate with voluntary codes of advice and guidance. Some retain control of CPD within the profession, but others are regulated by government or its agencies. In total, six references were identified which compared the development of teachers with other professionals: the main points from which are discussed below.

5.2 Training other professionals

Medicine

Booth et al. (1995) report findings from a research project – ‘the Hospital Project’ – in which they explored postgraduate training of doctors in hospitals in the East Anglia region of England. They believe that ‘such contrast and comparisons [between professions] can sharpen conceptions of the nature of professional training and development for teachers throughout their careers, clarifying the notion of acquiring competence and its relationship to propositional knowledge’ (Booth et al., 1995, p. 146). The research team describes how doctors spend 5–6 years of undergraduate study of the basic disciplines of medicine and surgery, plus 1 clinical year as a house officer, before attaining full registration with the General Medical Council. Training for pre-registration house officers and post-registration senior house officers (posts at the early stages of professional learning) consist of practical on-the-job experience together with academic study normally associated with examinations of the medical Royal Colleges (the professional associations established by royal charter which control the syllabus and examinations of various medical specialities). Newly qualified doctors at this stage usually hold posts on 6-monthly rotations and both continuing development and regular moves to other, hopefully well-regarded, teams are accepted as the way of gaining the necessary experience to proceed to a consultant by their mid- to late-30s. Although the researchers make no mention of it in their report, this traditional pattern is already giving way in some hospitals to 2-year training posts for registrars, which guarantees continuity of training in certain specialisms (Wilson and Pirrie, 1999).

New doctors may also be supported in other ways. For example, Ehrich et al. (2003) describe mentoring relationships as an invaluable learning process for beginners as well as experienced practitioners. They reviewed 82 articles published between 1995 and 2002 that relate to mentoring in a medical context. Unfortunately, most were not research-based, but offered descriptive accounts and generally recommended mentoring as a way of developing staff in the workplace. They report that many medical schools, particularly in the UK and USA, have implemented formalised mentoring programmes for junior staff. In addition, they quote examples of mentoring in the UK, for doctors who qualified overseas, or work in certain high stress specialities, such as Accident and Emergency departments. Only a minority of their original 82 articles provided evidence of either positive or negative outcomes from mentoring programmes, from which only eight instances were reported by doctors who had experienced...
personal growth as a consequence of a mentoring relationship. Organisational, attitudinal and time limitations were the most frequently cited constraints to the implementation of mentoring. In 2002, a project commissioned by the Scottish Executive (DTZ Pieda, 2002) recorded that there were no specific requirements for doctors to engage in CPD, although many doctors actively pursue CPD (as noted by Booth et al., 1995). DTZ Pieda reports that concerns have been expressed that not all doctors keep themselves up to date. As a consequence, the General Medical Council was piloting a revalidation procedure to ensure that all doctors were fit to practice. It is expected to include evidence of participation in CPD and information from their everyday practice, for 5-yearly revalidation.

Social work
DTZ Pieda (2002) provides further evidence of how members of other professions are developed. The study compared social work with selected other professions: general nursing, probation service, physiotherapy, occupational therapy, medicine, accountancy and teaching. At the time of writing, the authors point out that there was no statutory requirement for social workers to undertake CPD. However, the Codes of Practice for Social Service Workers and Employers (Scottish Social Services Council, 2002) places the onus on employers to provide opportunities for staff to undertake training and for staff to identify to employers and address through training, any weaknesses in their skills in relation to the role they are expected to perform. Criminal justice social workers (probation service) are qualified social workers in Scotland and the same encouragement to engage in CPD applies to them.

Accountancy
Chartered accountants in the UK must be a member of a professional body, for example the Institute of Chartered Accountants of Scotland (ICAS) or the Institute of Chartered Accountants in England and Wales (ICAEW). New requirements for continued professional learning stipulate that chartered accountants in public practice must undertake 55 hours of CPD each year, of which 10 hours must be structured and 45 hours may be composed of unstructured activities, such as reading professional journals and distance learning (DTZ Pieda, 2002).

Nursing
DTZ Pieda (2002) report that opportunities for nurses to engage in CPD are usually provided through in-service training, modular courses or reading. Most hospitals have Central Education Teams, which circulate information on internal and external courses. There is no single accreditation scheme, but CPD is a core requirement for continuing registration for nurses. They are required to re-register every 3 years and are expected to have undertaken the equivalent of 5 days (ie 35 hours) of CPD in the previous 3 years. Registered nurses are also expected to maintain a portfolio, so that the Nursing and Midwifery Council can check when nurses apply to re-register.

Physiotherapy
At the time they conducted their mapping survey, DTZ Pieda (2002) reported that there was no formal requirement for physiotherapists to participate in CPD, but, that they were expected to undertake CPD as part of the Chartered Society of Physiotherapy's (CSP) Rules of Professional Conduct. These advise physiotherapists to maintain a portfolio of CPD undertaken. However, the researchers anticipate that the creation of the Health Professions Council (HPC) in 2002 as a new body, which is reviewing and consulting on the education and CPD of health-related professionals, intends to make CPD a requirement to practise.
As with physiotherapy, the DTZ Pieda (2002) team found that CPD for occupational therapy was not prescribed. However, the College of Occupational Therapists (COTs) Code of Conduct stated that:

‘Occupational Therapists shall be personally responsible for actively maintaining and developing their personal competence and shall base delivery on accurate and current information in the interest in high quality care’.

(College of Occupational Therapists (COTs) Code of Conduct, p. 11)

The College also offers a number of open and distance learning courses to complement in-service provision.

5.3 Comparison with teaching

How does professional development for teachers compare with that offered to members of other professions as described above? In medicine for example, Booth et al. (1995) identify four main differences. First, unlike trainee teachers, most of whom in the UK pursue initial training in a higher education institute, house officers are salaried and work a full week in a hospital or clinical setting. Second, although the responsibilities of house officers vary across different specialisms, junior doctors are usually patients’ first point of contact and without them the service could not be delivered to patients. Third, junior doctors usually feel an integral part of a professional team and rely on the support of others including registrars and more experienced nursing staff. Fourth, training for hospital doctors who want to become consultants continues throughout their career from house officer, to senior house officer, registrar and senior registrar grades, until they achieve consultant status. In contrast, trainee teachers are typically full-time students, studying for an undergraduate BEd degree or a 1-year Postgraduate Certificate in an Education course in HEIs. Trainee teachers are students and the amount of responsibility they are given during periods of ‘teaching practice’ in schools varies. The researchers also argue that although secondary school trainee teachers usually join a subject department, the notion of teamwork is not as strongly developed in most schools as it is in hospitals. In addition, in medicine, the team and the clinical setting becomes the main focus for continuing professional development. Although both newly qualified teachers and doctors receive formal and informal training, senior doctors and colleagues usually take an active part in delivering the formal training for junior doctors. This can consist of lectures, seminars, tutorials and supervision intended to develop doctors’ knowledge, skills, or understanding. Study leave is provided so that junior doctors can prepare for professional examinations. Booth et al. (1995) report that junior doctors in their project took on average over 4 hours a week of formal training. They also received structured on-the-job training in a clinical, ward, or theatre setting. Alongside these formal opportunities, the researchers found that junior doctors learn informally in clinical settings from observation, discussion and working with more experienced colleagues and also from feedback and reflection. However, as Booth et al. (1995) argue, the big difference between teaching and medicine is that for the most part new doctors learn from other doctors within a team setting:

‘For the postgraduate doctor both the formal and informal teaching is done, for the most part, by practising doctors and such teaching and learning is seen as part of a team effort. For both undergraduate and postgraduate trainee teachers, training is the responsibility both of lecturers in higher education institutions and practising teachers in two different

---

1 It should be noted here that initial teacher education practices vary across the four home countries in the UK and there are at least six routes into teacher training in England, one of which is entirely school-based.
setting. Lecturers are not expert school teachers, whatever they once may have been; and there can be disjunction between the practice advocated in the training institution and that which is favoured in the school… notions of collegiality and teamwork are not nearly as well developed as in hospitals'.

(Booth et al., 1995, p. 150)

Others have attempted to compare the development of teachers to that received by professions related to medicine. For example, Castle et al. (1998) identify three common areas in CPD provided in teaching, nursing and radiography. First, they believe that in all three professions, funding of CPD is a major issue and extra resources to support initiatives have not been made available to individual professionals. Second, a major concern for both nurses and teachers is that there is 'a theory-practice gap' (p. 335) in which many practitioners perceive that the curriculum is remote from practice due to its academicisation by higher education institutions. Third, over the last decade, higher education institutions have established formal systems for managing accreditation in order to accredit competence and improve access. They point out that this has not been without criticism from researchers who believed that its main purpose was to monitor academic sub-contractors of professional bodies (Burrage, 1994), or in response to political concern for greater accountability (Becher, 1994).

Interestingly, there is some evidence that other professions may be seeking to emulate development in the teaching professions. For example, in 2003, a working group on Developing a Framework for CPD of the Association of Scottish Principal Education Psychologists (ASPEP) recommended that the continuing professional development of educational psychologists should be developed along similar lines to the CPD framework being developed for teachers in Scotland. It suggested that consideration should be given to accreditation of the framework by the British Psychological Society and that each psychologist should have an individual CPD plan derived from the local authority's local improvement plan, the service development plan, the outcomes of staff review and the individual's career aspirations (see <http://www.ltscotland.com/pdp> for further information).

5.4 Voluntary or compulsory CPD?

In some professions, CPD is compulsory, whereas in others it is optional but recommended. Barlow (1999) surveyed the renewal of licensing requirements for engineering, medicine, accountancy and law in Australia, New Zealand, the UK, the USA and Canada and compared these to teaching in Australia. He found that continuing professional development was part of the Career Management Guide issued to members of the Institution of Professional Engineers, New Zealand to help them manage their own careers. Engineers in New Zealand are required to undertake a minimum of 50 hours of CPD per year and failure to do so is a breach of the Institution's Code of Ethics. Another professional organisation, which has moved to compulsion, is the College of Family Physicians of Canada, which requires its members to have completed and submitted at least 50 credits of CPD annually. A similar programme called 'Maintenance of Competence' is also organised by the Royal College of Physicians and Surgeons of Canada, but participation is voluntary.

Accountants in the USA are licensed to practise by individual state government, often by the same departments of 'regulatory agencies' that deal with doctors and teachers. All states have compulsory licensing for public accountants and most have adopted or are adopting the Uniform Act devised by the American Institute of Certified Public Accounts and the National Association of State Boards of Accountancy, so as not to impose unnecessary barriers to practice and mobility across state boundaries. The Institute requires that all its members should increase their professional competence in an environment which it believes is more demanding than ever
before. Increasing specialisation, a proliferation of regulations and the complex nature of modern business require accountants to be continually updated. It is also supported by the Uniform Accountancy Act, which states that:

‘An applicant seeking renewal of a certificate of registration shall show that the applicant has completed no less than 120 hours of continuing professional education … during the three-year period preceding renewal, with a minimum of 20 hours in each year’.

(Uniform Accountancy Act, p. 33)

The Law Society of England and Wales regulates training, professional and service standards for solicitors. Under the Solicitors Act 1974, all solicitors must obtain an annual practising certificate. The Solicitors’ Practice Rule requires all solicitors to keep up-to-date with developments in law and to undertake 48 hours of CPD every 3 years. Part-time solicitors must do 1 hour per year for every 2 hours a week worked.

By way of comparison, Barlow points out that 42 states in the USA have mandatory requirements for professional development for teachers. This is defined as ‘any course work, experience, training or renewal activity required by a state to maintain the validity of a certificate [to teach]’ (p. 45). A few states offer a credential for life, leaving CPD to the employer; some issue permanent credentials subject to X number of years of CPD which meet their local School Board’s professional development requirements; and others require verification of professional development for renewal of the license to teach. Interestingly, one state – Colorado – has requirements which apply to teachers in the early stages of their professional lives. During the fifth year, teachers must meet with their supervisor to discuss professional goals, activities and standards for the whole 5-year period and submit a reflective commentary to the State Department of Education, in order to renew their licenses. In Connecticut, the Bureau of Certification and Professional Development requires every teacher to apply for a professional educator certificate every 5 years. Teachers must show that they have completed 90 hours of CPD or nine units of Continuing Education during the licensing period.

Barlow concludes that:

‘Continuing professional development is regarded as important, in fact essential, in teaching and most of the professions. The nub of the issue is whether it should be mandatory or voluntary. In both cases there must be accountability procedures, but if it is mandatory then compliance will need to be associated with a formalised process that enables the professional development to be verified. Compulsion means that some form of sanction must be available if the mandated [professional development] is not done. Voluntary professional organisations use continuing membership of the organisation (and the status and financial opportunities this brings) as an ultimate sanction. Where membership of the profession is mandated by statute, sanctions can be imposed as part of the ongoing requirements to maintain membership, eg by renewal of certification, or registration, or a practising certificate, or through a professional appraisal or peer review. In the case of the latter it will still be necessary to have some final form of sanction if there is no response’.

(Barlow, 1999, p. 71)

It should be noted that professionals are far from unanimous in their support of compulsory CPD. In a study of community pharmacists, Wilson and Bagley (1999) report that, in the UK, pharmacists currently undertake continuing education on a voluntary basis. The Royal Pharmaceutical Society of Great Britain (RPSGB) expects pharmacists, as a condition of registration, to engage in a minimum of 30 hours continuing education per year, as part of which
at least one face-to-face contact session with other pharmacists must be included. This expectation is not enforced and in the past the level of uptake of continuing education provision has not been particularly high. (In 1990, only 10–15 per cent of community pharmacists in England were estimated to be participating in continuing education.) An alternative approach based on mandatory CPD linked to the 'right to practise', as is the case in over half of the states in the USA, is not without its critics. Researchers argue that educational activities chosen under such schemes may reflect the desire to meet the mandatory requirements as quickly, painlessly and economically as possible.

5.5 Summary
A number of researchers have sought to compare initial training and CPD of teachers with that offered to members of other professions. The published evidence shows that:

- Following the McCrone Agreement, teachers in Scotland are required to undertake 35 hours of CPD per year.
- Two other professions in Scotland, accountancy and nursing, have introduced compulsory requirements for CPD as a condition of continuing to practise/re-registration.
- The requirement to undertake CPD is implicit in the Codes of Conduct which govern professional practice in some other professions in Scotland, eg social work.
- In the UK, some health-related professionals receive advice and support for CPD from their professional societies or colleges. For example, the Chartered Society of Physiotherapists and the College of Occupational Therapists recommend that members record CPD in a portfolio as a means of assessing current skills and knowledge. The Royal Pharmaceutical Society of Great Britain recommends that its members engage in 30 hours of continuing education per year.
- Professions related to medicine in the UK are covered by the Health Professions Council, which it is anticipated will establish standards for education and training and require professionals to provide evidence of the education and training they have undertaken.
- Some believe that within the next 5 years, the General Medical Council will introduce a compulsory system of CPD as a requirement for revalidation of doctors.
- Unlike teaching, most CPD for new doctors is provided by other experienced doctors in the workplace. Newly qualified doctors also learn informally from other doctors and more experienced nurses.
- Following a survey of CPD in teaching, engineering, medicine, accountancy and law in Australia, New Zealand, the UK and USA, Barlow (1999) concludes that CPD is important to all professions; some have made it a requirement for practice, while the remainder perceive it to be implicit in the profession's code of professional conduct.
- Castle et al. (1998) identify commonalities in CPD for teachers, radiographers and nurses: all share issues related to available funding, the relevance of the curriculum offered by higher education providers and accreditation.
- Some researchers point out that by making CPD compulsory, members of various professions may seek to comply with the requirement in the quickest, easiest way they can.
6 Findings and conclusions

6.1 Introduction

As mentioned in the Introduction to the Review, the overarching aim of this review is to present the evidence on Professional Development in the Early Years of Teaching by systematically reviewing literature published during the past 10 years in Scotland, the rest of the UK and abroad. It was intended to inform policy development, share effective practices and underpin future research. Unfortunately, despite identifying over 3500 articles related to CPD in various electronic databases and by hand searching iteratively, very few articles met our criteria for inclusion in this review. Therefore, we have had to relax these criteria and have included studies, which shed some light on the early professional learning even though it was not the main focus of the research. The main findings from these are summarised below.

6.2 Findings

Developmental stages

Researchers (Bolam, 2000; Harland and Kinder, 1997; Lee, 1997) suggest that teachers pass through a number of developmental stages as they progress from beginner to expert practitioner. Specifically:

- Some researchers associate different concerns with different stages of a teacher's development. The most widely cited model was developed by Fuller (Fuller, 1969; Fuller and Brown, 1975), who identified the stages as: concern for self (primary survival as a teacher); concern for the task (which focuses on actual performance) and concern for impact (relating to positive influence upon pupils).
- More recent research, while accepting Fuller's model, offers slight amendments. Pigge and Marso (1997) suggest that beginner teachers are concerned about impact throughout their development; and Clark and Conway (2003) argue that beginner teachers simultaneously pursue a 'journey outward' and an 'inward journey' as their concerns deepen through reflectivity and attention to self-development.
- Allen and Casbergue (1997) report that beginner teachers are able to recall events in the classroom reasonably accurately and thus begin to reflect on their own performance; in contrast more experienced teachers take a more holistic approach to their recall, performance and achievement of objectives.

Influences on teachers' careers

A number of studies identify factors that influence beginner teachers' career decisions:

- Johnson and Birkeland (2003) report that those who felt successful were more likely to remain in the profession.
- Gay and Ryan (1996) found that inexperienced teachers remained in their post because they liked the job, but were dissatisfied with the number of changes and the workload.
- Flores (2001) notes the strong impact of the workplace on inexperienced teachers' development.
Developing Teachers: a review of early professional learning

Models and organisation of continuing professional development

Researchers (e.g., Castle et al., 1998; Clark and Hollingsworth, 2002; Draper et al., 1991; Harland and Kinder, 1997; Ling and Mackenzie, 2001; Thomas et al., 1998) offer a number of explanatory models of CPD. These include partnerships, apprenticeships, technocratic, competence-based, input/output, linear, collegiate/community of learners and interactive/interconnected approaches. In summary:

- Some researchers (Bolam, 2000; McMahon, 1999) suggest that the emphasis of CPD in the UK has shifted from a focus on teachers’ individual needs to meeting systemic needs which reflect Government policy to raise standards and ensure managerial accountability.
- A number of studies (Bolam, 2000; Hustler et al., 2003) indicate that teachers define CPD conservatively and associate it primarily with attendance at courses, seminars, or workshops.
- There has been a tendency across most European countries (Eurydice, 2003) to devolve responsibility for the budgets for teachers’ CPD to school or local levels.
- CPD for teachers in the UK is offered by a variety of public and private sector providers (Bolam, 2000; Hustler et al., 2003). These include higher education institutions (HEIs), education authorities, schools and private consultancies.
- In Northern Ireland (Kearns, 2001) different organisations act as lead partner for different stages of teacher education: HEIs are responsible for initial teacher education; Education and Library Boards lead on induction; and schools on CPD.
- Increasingly, researchers (e.g., Ling and Mackenzie, 2001) perceive CPD to be most effectively organised as a partnership between HEIs, employers and teachers.

Early professional development

We found that teachers’ early professional learning is an under-researched area and an ill-defined career-stage in terms of the key words used to describe it: only 13 references emerged from our short list of 126 articles which related to career development and ‘beginning teachers’. Furthermore, most of these were concerned with the induction period. Specifically:

- A number of papers describe the stages which teachers are thought to pass through as they develop their careers. Brighouse (1995) suggests there are five stages: initial education and training, beginner teacher to established expert, early management to established expert, consultant practitioner and teacher entering retirement. He also argues that all beginners should enter the profession on the understanding that they undertake an MA in Education as early professional development.
- Some researchers (Hustler et al., 2003; Lewis et al., 1999) report differences in teachers’ choice of CPD activity according to their length of time in the profession.
- Hustler et al. (2003) found that in England older teachers seemed to accept CPD could not relate to their individual professional needs: in contrast many younger teachers and newly qualified staff believed that CPD could meet systemic needs and also wanted their individual development needs to be met.
- Lewis et al. (1999) report that inexperienced teachers in the USA were more likely to select CPD related to classroom management (65 per cent of those with 3 or fewer years, compared with 43 per cent of those with 20 or more years experience). Newly qualified teachers were also more likely to participate in in-depth studies relating to their main teaching assignment and programmes addressing the needs of students with limited proficiency in English or from diverse cultural backgrounds.
- Kearns (2001) reports that primary teachers at the end of their third year of teaching in Northern Ireland report undertaking CPD in writing, pupil behaviour, reading and aspects of
the religious curriculum. Evidence is included in their Professional Development Activities' portfolios, which all teachers in Northern Ireland must now maintain.

- Killevy (2001) found that inexperienced teachers in Ireland who had performed less well in the Irish School Leaving Certificate and in their BEd degree were more likely to participate in in-service training than their more academically able colleagues.

- Pigge and Marso (1997) report that those new teachers in the USA who had been good students expressed less concern about self-survival in teaching and may be lulled into very low levels of self-concern by their previous academic success.

**Voluntary or compulsory CPD?**

A number of researchers have compared initial training and CPD of teachers with that offered to members of other professions. This should be located within the context of the McCrone Agreement, following which teachers in Scotland are now required to undertake 35 hours of CPD per year. The evidence shows that:

- Two other professions in Scotland, accountancy and nursing, have introduced compulsory requirements for CPD as a condition of continuing to practise/re-registration (DTZ Pieda, 2002).

- The requirement to undertake CPD is implicit in the codes of conduct which govern professional practice in some other professions in Scotland, eg social work (DTZ Pieda, 2002).

- In the UK, some health-related professionals receive advice and support for CPD from their professional societies or colleges. For example, the Chartered Society of Physiotherapists and the College of Occupational Therapists recommend that members record CPD in a portfolio as a means of assessing current skills and knowledge (DTZ Pieda, 2002). The Royal Pharmaceutical Society of Great Britain suggests that its members engage in 30 hours continuing education per year (Wilson and Bagley, 1999).

- Professions related to medicine in the UK are covered by the Health Professions Council, which it is anticipated will establish standards for education and training and require professionals to provide evidence of the education and training they have undertaken (DTZ Pieda, 2002).

- Some believe that within the next 5 years, the General Medical Council will introduce a compulsory system of CPD as a requirement for revalidation of doctors (DTZ Pieda, 2002).

- Following a survey of CPD in teaching, engineering, medicine, accountancy and law in Australia, New Zealand, the UK and the USA, Barlow concludes that CPD is important to all professions; some have made it a requirement for practice, while the remainder perceive it to be implicit in the profession’s code of professional conduct (Barlow, 1999).

- Castle et al. (1998) identify commonalities in CPD for teachers, radiographers and nurses: all share issues related to available funding, the relevance of the curriculum offered by higher education providers and accreditation.

- Some researchers point out that by making CPD compulsory, members of various professions may seek to comply with the requirement in the quickest, easiest way they can (Wilson and Bagley, 1999).

- CPD is also compulsory for teachers in approximately half of the countries in the European Union and most of the states in the USA (Eurydice, 2003). This ranges from a minimum of 12 hours per year in Latvia to 166 hours in the Netherlands.
Scottish evidence

No studies of teachers’ early professional learning (ie post-probation) in Scottish schools was identified. From the remaining Scottish-based studies, we found that:

- Ross (1996) suggests that staff development in Scottish secondary education has developed from a focus on individual teachers to become a function of management and responsive to central control.
- Humes (2001) argues that the year 2000 marked a ‘watershed’, with the publication of the McCrone report and the subsequent development of a national framework for Continuing Professional Development.
- Purdon (2001, 2003) thinks that the Standards in Scotland’s Schools etc Act (2000) and the McCrone Report have been major influences in the development of CPD for Scottish teachers.
- No Scottish education authority provided evidence that it had developed policies or provision for teachers in the early years of their professional development: one reported that it was currently consulting on a policy which would cover the first five years of professional practice (personal correspondence, 20 February 2004).
- Available evidence on participation in CPD among Scottish teachers (O’Brien and McGettrick, 1995; MVA, 1999) does not provide a breakdown of the results by the length of experience of the participants.
- Purdon (2000) found that 91 per cent of teachers who had qualified in the previous two years thought that ‘having a commitment to career-long professional development’ was central to the concept of professionalism.
- A very large study of early professional learning, part of the ESRC Teaching and Learning Research Programme, has been commissioned (McNally et al., on-going), but this will not report until 2008.

6.3 Conclusions

Stages of development

Many researchers accept that members of the teaching profession develop through a series of career stages, each of which is associated with specific needs and concerns. The needs of the new teacher represent a transition from a focus on self and survival, to task and impact. However, the specific needs associated with each have not been well defined by research.

Influences on career

A number of studies show that new teachers’ careers can be influenced by their experiences in the early years of professional practice. A supportive school and/or department appear to be the strongest positive influence on career development. By contrast, a heavy workload and perceptions of constant change are career inhibitors.

Models of professional development

No one model of CPD was shown to be the most effective. However, researchers favour partnerships between individual teachers, schools and HEIs, based upon negotiated needs. They also indicate that many teachers define CPD conservatively to mean courses, seminars and
workshops. None has gone so far as to suggest that the professional development of teachers should emulate medicine and become predominantly workplace-based and delivered by practising members of the same profession.

**Early professional development**

What little evidence emerged seems to suggest that the needs of new teachers differ from those of their more experienced colleagues. They want their individual development needs to be met and are more likely to undertake CPD related to classroom management or specific aspects of the curriculum. Researchers argue that CPD should be based upon diverse inter-related personal and professional needs.

**Other professions**

The teaching profession in Scotland has accepted that CPD should be compulsory throughout a teacher’s career. This accords with practices in numerous other professions and also in the teaching profession in many European countries and states in the USA. However, the contrast with the early professional development of doctors in the UK is stark. Until appointed consultants, doctors accept that most of their formal early professional learning will take place in the workplace (ie in hospitals and clinics) and be organised and delivered by other more senior members of their own profession. They also expect to learn informally from experienced colleagues and nursing staff as they jointly deliver a health service to patients. Some researchers argue that schools would have to be modified if they are to support a more school-based approach to CPD, which is responsive to teachers’ needs.

**Scottish evidence**

There is no relevant published Scottish research about teachers’ early professional learning and evidence in this area will only emerge in 2008 when on-going research is completed.

**6.4 Implications**

The key message to come from this review is simple: a great deal of effort is being put into developing frameworks for CPD for various stages of a teacher’s career. The Scottish Executive, education authorities in Scotland, teachers’ professional associations, HEIs and the GTCS, all seem to be aware of the need to offer support to probationer teachers and also career development opportunities for those who wish to pursue Chartered Teacher status or Scottish Qualification for Headship in order to further their careers. Some of these initiatives have been the subject of published evaluations (Malcolm and Wilson, 2000; Murphy et al., 2002). So far little attention appears to have been paid to:

- Identifying the CPD needs specifically associated with the transition from inexperienced to experienced teacher
- Developing provision to meet these needs
- Identifying provision and support which new teachers have found helpful
- Evaluating the impact of such CPD on new teachers’ personal and professional development, their career satisfaction and retention and changes in their classroom practices and the subsequent effect on pupils.

Apart from the on-going ESRC study (McNally et al.), teachers’ early professional learning has been a neglected area.
References


References


Appendix 1: Search strategy

- Research evidence relating to the specified topic was obtained by searching bibliographic databases and the Internet for relevant journal articles, government reports, policy documents and Conference proceedings. (See Table A1 for a breakdown of 3560 references found from a systematic search of bibliographic databases.)
- Hand searching of relevant material was also undertaken where papers were not available in electronic form.
- Key word searching was undertaken in a flexible and pragmatic but transparent way as different research indices use slightly different key wording terms and strategies. (Terminology to describe the career-stage under investigation in this review, is particularly ill-defined.) We also developed our key words by holding a workshop for HEI teacher educators. Following the workshop, key words were circulated ‘DELPHI’ style to members of the two review groups to facilitate a final decision.
- In addition a set of inclusion (and exclusion) criteria were formulated to fit the questions posed in the study specification.
- References were organised using an electronic database (EndNote) and codes were attributed to specific questions/issues. Initial reading of the research material by the review team determined whether it contained salient issues on the topic. Each reference that met the study criteria was coded/categorised and details entered onto the database for ease of information extraction at a later stage in the project. A short list of references were listed that appeared to meet the inclusion criteria of the study topics (based on their title and abstract details) and information was circulated to the second review group of teacher educators.
- When all relevant material had been obtained, in-depth review of the literature was undertaken to extract information relating to the specified questions and also to evaluate the quality of the research. At this stage, the set of literature was narrowed to include only those that contribute to the review questions.
- Concurrently, unpublished (or ‘grey’) literature was identified via the Education-Line database and searches were conducted of current research project listings (eg from SEED, DfEE, ESRC, TTA, LATS).
- SCRE Centre researchers analysed and extracted information from selected research studies which met the inclusion criteria, in order to identify information on CPD in the early years of teaching.
- Key articles were circulated to the second review group, the members of which were encouraged to read the articles and comment on the emerging themes.
- Finally, the outcomes from the searches and analysis were synthesised and judgments made. Conclusions, based upon sound evidence, are presented.
Table A1: Literature search log

Below is a log of the searching conducted for the review. Listed are the results of information provided by the review advisory group, results of hand searches of journals and a list of the results of electronic searches. The search strategy used on all databases was based on key words. Truncation symbols may be different, or eliminated, for the requirements of each different database.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SOURCE (database/interface, eg ERIC/OVID)</th>
<th>DATE CAPTURED</th>
<th>SEARCH STRATEGY</th>
<th>NO. OF HITS</th>
<th>DOWNLOADED FILE SAVED AS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AEI</td>
<td>1MAR04</td>
<td>Q-W-00=TEACHER? AND (Q-P-PY=&quot;1993&quot; OR &quot;1994&quot; OR &quot;1995&quot; OR &quot;1996&quot; OR &quot;1997&quot; OR &quot;1998&quot; OR &quot;1999&quot; OR &quot;2000&quot; OR &quot;2001&quot; OR &quot;2002&quot; OR &quot;2003&quot;) AND (Q-W-00=Q-W-00=TEACHER DEVELOPMENT OR STAFF DEVELOPMENT OR CAREER DEVELOPMENT OR (Q-W-00=CONTINUING EDUCATION OR INSET OR PROFESSIONAL TRAINING OR IN-SERVICE OR (Q-W-00=PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT OR CONTINUING PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT OR CPD))));</td>
<td>519</td>
<td>AEI Search</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ASSIA</td>
<td>1MAR04</td>
<td>DE=teacher* and school and (KW=(practice development) or (skills development) or (knowledge development)) or KW=(staff development) or (career development) or (learning organization) or KW=(INSET or (professional training) or (in-service training) or (in-service education)) or KW=((continuing professional development) or (professional development) or (CPD))</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>assia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BEI</td>
<td>23FEB04</td>
<td>Q-W-00=TEACHER? AND (Q-P-PY=&quot;1993&quot; OR &quot;1994&quot; OR &quot;1995&quot; OR &quot;1996&quot; OR &quot;1997&quot; OR &quot;1998&quot; OR &quot;1999&quot; OR &quot;2000&quot; OR &quot;2001&quot; OR &quot;2002&quot; OR &quot;2003&quot;) AND (Q-W-00=Q-W-00=TEACHER DEVELOPMENT OR STAFF DEVELOPMENT OR CAREER DEVELOPMENT OR (Q-W-00=CONTINUING EDUCATION OR INSET OR PROFESSIONAL TRAINING OR IN-SERVICE OR (Q-W-00=PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT OR CONTINUING PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT OR CPD))));</td>
<td>306</td>
<td>bei search</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Educational research abstracts</td>
<td>1MAR04</td>
<td>[Key words] contains all words 'professional development' OR [Title] contains all words 'professional development' AND [Year] &gt;= 1993</td>
<td>377 (343 unique records)</td>
<td>era</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ERIC (CSA)</td>
<td>1MAR04</td>
<td>DE=teacher* and school and (KW=(practice development) or (skills development) or (knowledge development)) or KW=(staff development) or (career development) or (learning organization) or KW=(INSET or (professional training) or (teacher development) or (in-service training) or (in-service education)) or KW=((continuing professional development) or (professional development) or (CPD))</td>
<td>1985</td>
<td>eric_search</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SOURCE (database/interface, eg ERIC/OVID)</td>
<td>DATE CAPTURED</td>
<td>SEARCH STRATEGY</td>
<td>NO. OF HITS</td>
<td>DOWNLOADED FILE SAVED AS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>------------</td>
<td>--------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IBSS</td>
<td>26FEB04</td>
<td>( (professional development) , cpd , inset , (&quot;in-service education&quot;) ) , (&quot;in-service training&quot;) , (continuing professional development) , (professional training) , (teacher development) , (staff development) , (career development) , (learning organisation*) , (teacher research*) , (action research) , (reflective practice*) , (reflective teaching) , (skills development) , (knowledge development) , (practice development) ) @TKA + (teacher* , school*) @GC [English language + &gt;=1993 only]</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>ibss</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CERUK</td>
<td>4MAR04</td>
<td>Keywords: Teacher dismissal; Teacher commitment; Teacher role; Teacher status; Teacher resignation; Teacher behaviour; Teacher retirement; Teacher perceptions; Teacher motivation; Teacher training agency; Teacher training institutes; Teachers; Teacher mentors; Teacher support; Teacher student relationship; Teacher morale; Teacher stress; Teacher involvement; Teacher burnout; Teacher shortage; Teacher competencies; Teacher attitudes; Teacher development; Teacher careers; Teacher autonomous; Teacher opinions; Teacher expectations; Teacher recruitment; Teacher retention; Teacher feedback; Teacher mobility; Teacher assessment; Teacher pupil relationship; Teacher placement; Teacher attraction; Teacher educators; Teacher experience; Teacher workload; Teacher researchers; Teacher education; Teacher appraisal; Teacher effectiveness; Teacher absenteeism; Teacher influence; Teacher promotion; Teacher salaries; Teacher responsibility; Teacher induction; Teacher appointment AND [Key words] Professional development; Professional expertise</td>
<td>113</td>
<td>ceruk.html</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education-Line</td>
<td>4MAR04</td>
<td>(((TEACHER$ AND ((CONTINUING PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT) OR CPD OR (CONTINUING EDUCATION) OR (IN-SERVICE) OR INSET OR (PROFESSIONAL TRAINING) OR (TEACHER DEVELOPMENT) OR (STAFF DEVELOPMENT) OR (CAREER DEVELOPMENT) OR (LEARNING ORGANISATION) OR (TEACHER RESEARCH) OR (ACTION RESEARCH) OR (REFLECTIVE PRACTICE) OR (REFLECTIVE TEACHING) OR (SKILLS DEVELOPMENT) OR (KNOWLEDGE DEVELOPMENT) OR (PRACTICE DEVELOPMENT) OR COMPETENC$))) AND ($PROFESSION$)[SUBJ]))</td>
<td>157</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>